Arizona Highways Magazine: Tracking Shifts in Reader Habits

Arizona Department of Transportation Research Center
Arizona Highways Magazine: Tracking Shifts in Reader Habits

SPR-732
September 2016

Prepared by:
Diane Hart Ginn, Debra C. Pryor, and Deborah Meyers
Partners In Brainstorms, Inc.
3420 E. Shea Blvd, Suite 130
Phoenix, AZ 85028

Published by:
Arizona Department of Transportation
206 South 17th Avenue
Phoenix, AZ 85007
In cooperation with
US Department of Transportation
Federal Highway Administration
This report was funded in part through grants from the Federal Highway Administration, U.S. Department of Transportation. The contents of this report reflect the views of the authors, who are responsible for the facts and the accuracy of the data, and for the use or adaptation of previously published material, presented herein. The contents do not necessarily reflect the official views or policies of the Arizona Department of Transportation or the Federal Highway Administration, U.S. Department of Transportation. This report does not constitute a standard, specification, or regulation. Trade or manufacturers’ names that may appear herein are cited only because they are considered essential to the objectives of the report. The U.S. government and the State of Arizona do not endorse products or manufacturers.
The primary mission of *Arizona Highways* magazine (*AHM*) is to promote travel and tourism in Arizona. The magazine has conducted a subscriber survey approximately every five years since the early 1990s, with the last survey conducted in 2009. However, no longitudinal analysis of survey data has ever been conducted to identify trends over time. This study has provided information regarding the reading habits of *AHM* subscribers, their interest in *AHM* editorial content, and their opinions regarding their subscriber experience. Findings from the study also provided insights into *AHM* customer loyalty, engagement, and purchasing behaviors; the perceived value of subscribership and trust in the *AHM* brand as a credible source for travel information; reader likelihood of recommending *AHM* to others; and the influence of *AHM* on tourism. Finally, this study also provided information obtained from former *AHM* subscribers, including their primary reasons for nonrenewal and suggestions regarding benefits or offers that would encourage them to reconsider subscribing. Recommendations were developed to assist *AHM* in adjusting its scope and focus to respond to changing reader expectations and preferences, particularly those in the 25–54 age group, and to support ongoing improvement in *AHM*’s marketing and promotion activities and customer service processes. The recommendations are presented within a suggested implementation plan consisting of short-, mid-, and long-term actions.

The research findings can be used by *AHM* to inform development of subscriber acquisition and retention strategies and to ensure that business planning, editorial, and marketing strategies align with reader expectations of *AHM* regarding the inherent trust and credibility of its brand.
# CONTENTS

Introduction ................................................................................................................................................ 1  
Objective ................................................................................................................................................ 1  

## Data Collection Methodology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subscriber Survey</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Former Subscriber Survey</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subscriber Focus Groups</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Key Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Theme 1: Trust in AHM Brand</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 2: Influence of AHM on Arizona Travel and Tourism</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 3: Subscriber Esteem and Loyalty</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 4: Subscriber Engagement and Purchasing Behaviors</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 5: Subscriber Reading Behaviors and Preferences</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 6: Subscriber Suggestions for Improvement</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendations</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Top-Priority Recommendations</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second-Tier Recommendations</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implementation</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Short-Term Implementation</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Term Implementation</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-Term Implementation</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A: Subscriber Survey Findings</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B: Supplemental Analysis of Arizona Highways Magazine Subscribers</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C: Former Subscriber Survey Findings</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix D: Subscriber Focus Group Findings</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix E: Analysis of Arizona Highways Magazine Promoters</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS, ACRONYMS, AND SYMBOLS

ADOT .................. Arizona Department of Transportation

AHM .................. Arizona Highways magazine

MPA .................. Association of Magazine Media (formerly the Magazine Publishers Association)

NPS .................. Net Promoter Score
INSIGHTS INTO ARIZONA HIGHWAYS MAGAZINE READER HABITS

INTRODUCTION

The primary mission of Arizona Highways magazine (AHM) is to promote travel and tourism in Arizona. Geared toward an audience with high interest in Arizona's history and culture, this monthly publication highlights unusual outdoor experiences, expert travelogues, and historical stories and features spectacular, award-winning photography that has gained the magazine worldwide recognition. According to the Arizona Highways website, the publication currently has over one million readers and circulates in all 50 states and in two-thirds of the world’s countries.

The magazine has conducted a subscriber survey approximately every five years since the early 1990s, with the most recent survey conducted in 2009. However, no longitudinal analysis of survey data has ever been conducted to identify trends over time. As noted by the Task Assignment for this study, subscriptions to Arizona Highways magazine have declined over the past decade, as they have with print media in general due to changing demographics and competition from digital media products.

It should be noted that 2009, the last year AHM conducted a survey of subscribers, was also the year in which the U.S. economy entered a major recession. As would be expected, consumer demand for magazines in general contracted as many Americans cut discretionary spending in the face of lower disposable income. Even among more affluent households, subscriptions and single-copy sales fell, along with reduced advertising revenues. However, as disposable income has slowly been increasing since 2009, external competition from digital content has also been growing. According to the Association of Magazine Media (MPA), magazines that will succeed and experience moderate growth in the future will focus on niche markets and embrace digital formats and online extensions. For Arizona Highways to succeed with its niche market, the magazine needs to fully understand the characteristics, profiles, and reading habits of its subscribers, both print and digital.

Objective

Consequently, the overall objective for this study was to provide AHM staff with information in four general areas:

- Demographics of current AHM subscribers
- Primary reasons for nonrenewal by former subscribers
- Benefits and offers that would encourage former subscribers to reconsider subscribing
- Strategies for adjusting feature content and marketing to respond to the changing expectations and media preferences of AHM subscribers, particularly those in the 25-54 age group
Based on that objective, the study was designed to obtain information about and develop insights into the following characteristics, preferences, and behaviors of AHM subscribers:

- Reading habits
- Interest in AHM editorial content, including monthly features and other subject content areas
- Opinions about their AHM subscriber experience
- Customer loyalty, engagement, and purchasing behaviors
- Perceived value of subscribership and trust in the AHM brand as a credible source for travel information (e.g., magazine, AHM Travel Guides)
- Likelihood of recommending AHM to others
- Influence of AHM on tourism.
- Lifestyle data, including use of technology devices, social media tools, and subscriptions to other magazines

The study also investigated characteristics and opinions of AHM former subscribers, such as factors contributing to nonrenewal, specific benefits that might encourage renewal, perceptions of AHM, and likelihood of recommending the publication to others.

DATA COLLECTION METHODOLOGY

A comprehensive online survey of current subscribers was conducted to obtain information on AHM reader habits, interests, and preferences. To complement the data from current subscribers, a brief survey of former AHM subscribers was also conducted. Additionally, two follow-up focus groups were held with select subscriber survey respondents to explore specific topics related to AHM reader preferences, awareness and use of AHM products, and general opinions regarding AHM and competitor publications.

Data collection commenced in July 2015 and concluded in February 2016. On completion of each data collection stage, detailed information on the participants and findings was provided to the AHM staff. These presentations, along with documentation of participant responses, are provided as appendices to this report.
Subscriber Survey

The criteria governing compilation of the recruitment list for the AHM subscriber survey excluded individuals with one or more of the following characteristics: non-U.S. mailing address, complimentary magazine subscription, had received fewer than six issues, and had requested that contact information not be shared with outside parties. As an incentive to complete the survey, subscribers were offered a 35 percent discount that could be applied to AHM online or in-store purchases made through December 31, 2015, and were automatically entered into a drawing for an AHM gift basket that included selected products valued at over $200.

The survey generated response from 897 current AHM subscribers, representing 5 percent of the targeted audience of current subscribers and a representative sample of the AHM subscriber file used for recruitment. Subscribers who had received seven to 36 issues of AHM represented 33 percent of the recruitment list and 31 percent of survey respondents; those who had received 37 to 60 issues represented 8 percent of the recruitment list and 13 percent of survey respondents; and those who had received 61 or more issues represented 59 percent of the recruitment list and 56 percent of survey respondents. At the request of AHM staff, a detailed analysis of the findings by number of issues received (7 to 36 issues, 37 to 60 issues, and 61 or more issues) was performed. Findings from this analysis are presented as Appendix B of this report, which is available from the ADOT Research Center upon request.

The 897 completed surveys represented a sampling error margin of ±3.24 percent at the conventional 95 percent confidence level. Demographic characteristics of survey respondents were as follows:

- 62 percent male
- 43 percent between the ages of 65 and 74, 40 percent ages 35 to 64, 16 percent age 75 and older, and 1 percent ages 18 to 34
- 64 percent lived in Arizona either full-time or part-time
- 38 percent had lived in Arizona for 20 or more years, 13 percent for 15 to 19 years, 17 percent for 10 to 14 years, and 33 percent for less than 10 years

Detailed information on the current subscriber survey methodology, participants, and findings are provided as Appendix A of this report.

Former Subscriber Survey

An additional goal of the study was to obtain supplemental information regarding former subscribers, including factors or dynamics contributing to nonrenewal, use of tools such as the AHM website, benefits that could potentially incentivize renewal, and the likelihood of recommending AHM to others.
The target audience for this brief online survey consisted of former subscribers who had received 12 to 24 issues and those who had received 37 or more issues. The criteria governing compilation of the AHM former subscriber survey recruitment list were similar to that used for current subscribers, as was the incentive offered for completing the survey: a 35 percent discount that could be applied to AHM online or in-store purchases made through December 31, 2015.

The survey generated response from 119 individuals, representing 1.9 percent of the targeted audience of AHM former subscribers. Former subscribers who had received 12 to 24 issues represented 27 percent of the survey recruitment list and 39 percent of survey respondents; those who had received 37 or more issues represented 73 percent of the survey recruitment list and 61 percent of survey respondents. The 119 completed surveys represented a margin of sampling error of ±8.85 percent at the conventional 95 percent confidence level and 7.45 percent at a 90 percent confidence level. It is important to note that the sampling error rate does not factor in adjustments for the extremely high number of bad e-mail addresses and ongoing difficulties experienced in trying to reach members of this group, all of which reduced the universe of potentially eligible respondents. Demographic characteristics of survey respondents were as follows:

- 53 percent female
- 48 percent between the ages of 35 and 64, 39 percent ages 65 to 74, 10 percent ages 75 and older, and 3 percent ages 18 to 34
- 73 percent lived in Arizona either full-time or part-time

Detailed demographic information on the former subscriber survey methodology, participants, and findings are provided as Appendix C of this report.

**Subscriber Focus Groups**

The two focus groups conducted with subscriber survey respondents were aimed at eliciting in-depth discussion of such topics as story-related preferences (e.g., length, interest in public interest stories); value of AHM as a travel guide resource; reader awareness of and interest in other AHM publications, including digital and printed formats; and opinions regarding the AHM website. A total of 13 individuals participated in the two groups.

Detailed information on the focus group methodology, participants, and findings are provided as Appendix D of this report.
KEY FINDINGS

An extensive analysis of the qualitative and quantitative research findings produced insights on a number of themes related to AHM subscribers’ attitudes and behaviors.

“You have to have something that speaks to the rest of the world, for a particular region. If it’s not this magazine, then what is it in Arizona?”

Theme 1: Trust in AHM Brand

AHM readers view the publication as having set a high standard for excellence, and have similar respect for the overall AHM brand.

Across the board, participants praised AHM’s quality. Nearly all current subscribers (94 percent) agreed that the AHM brand is one they trust—whether subscribing to the magazine or purchasing an AHM guidebook, they count on the AHM name for a quality publication. Former subscribers also attested to the belief that AHM is a “superior quality” magazine and one that proved a “valuable asset” while they were living in Arizona. Similarly, focus group participants lauded AHM for the quality of its publications and expressed their satisfaction with the content and photographic excellence associated with the AHM brand.

Analysis of comments from former subscribers regarding what AHM could do to keep valued subscribers like them revealed that the primary reasons for nonrenewal were financial and “other” (e.g., moved out of state, cut back on all subscriptions, not enough time to read). A significant majority commented favorably on the magazine and, in a number of instances, expressed their regret in needing to cancel.

The topic of AHM travel guides was explored extensively in the focus groups. Participants were asked to comment on their awareness and use of these publications and, if applicable, how their content compares with other publications that they have purchased. The majority had purchased one or more AHM travel guides and reported that they were extremely satisfied with their purchases. Participants also reported that they had purchased guides from other publishers as well as received guides as gifts, but could not recall the titles or publishers. These other guidebooks were primarily described as location-specific and containing highly detailed information, and were used by participants to supplement the more general information—often described as “tourist-focused” travel guide information—provided by AHM guidebooks.

More than three-quarters (78 percent) of current subscriber survey respondents reported using the AHM website, with 45 percent of all respondents using the site one to two times per year, 22 percent using it once a month or more, and 15 percent using it quarterly. Subscriber views regarding the AHM website were more extensively explored during the focus groups. Overall, the AHM website received
high marks (rated good to excellent) in standard metrics, such as ease of navigation, organization of site, ease of search, and ease of finding information about how to subscribe or renew one’s subscription. Additionally, participants strongly agreed with a number of statements assessing the effectiveness of the website in inspiring interest in Arizona travel destinations, influencing the decision to travel, and providing information perceived to be credible and trustworthy.

Both current and former subscribers would overwhelmingly recommend AHM to others.

The vast majority of subscriber survey respondents (97 percent) as well as former subscriber survey respondents (84 percent) reported that they would likely recommend AHM to others, a testament to readers’ positive regard for the magazine. When analyzing current subscriber response using Net Promoter Score (NPS), a scoring system used to define the loyalty of a firm’s customers by asking about their likelihood of recommending the firm to others, AHM received a superior NPS score of 84. The standard NPS rating scale identifies customers as either: Promoters, loyal enthusiasts who will keep buying and refer others; Passives, satisfied but unenthusiastic customers who are vulnerable to competitive offerings; or Detractors, unhappy customers who can damage the brand and impede growth through negative word of mouth. Among the current subscriber survey respondents, Promoters constituted 86 percent, Passives constituted 12 percent, and Detractors 2 percent. Overall positive regard for AHM was also evidenced by the vast majority (86 percent) of current subscribers who reported that they had had a positive customer experience when purchasing or renewing their subscription to AHM.

To obtain additional insight into the AHM customer experience, former subscribers were also asked how likely they were to recommend AHM to others. These individuals gave AHM an NPS score of 48, which is considered good (an NPS of 50 or greater is considered excellent). Among the former subscriber survey respondents, Promoters constituted 64 percent, Passives constituted 20 percent, and Detractors constituted 16 percent. Positive regard for AHM was evidenced by the vast majority (88 percent) of former subscribers who rated their overall satisfaction with AHM as satisfied to extremely satisfied. Additionally, when asked, “As a courtesy, would you like us to have AHM contact you about renewing your subscription?” slightly more than one-quarter of survey respondents (28 percent) responded in the affirmative.

A detailed analysis of the respondents identified as Promoters is provided as Appendix E of this report.
Theme 2: Influence of AHM on Arizona Travel and Tourism

AHM is playing a vital role in promoting tourism in Arizona, thus serving its mission and purpose.

The vast majority of current subscribers (88 percent) reported that AHM has influenced their choice of travel destinations in Arizona. Additionally, a number of current and former survey respondents as well as focus group participants commented on the pivotal role that AHM played in their travel decisions. One individual stated, “I inherited the subscription from my parents who started subscribing in 1970 when they moved to Tucson. They saved all their issues and I enjoyed reading through them. I have driven many of the day trips and several of the overnights.”

AHM has effectively translated subscriber interest in Arizona travel destinations into motivation to travel.

The vast majority of current subscribers reported that AHM has motivated them to travel in Arizona on day trips (81 percent) or multi-day trips (79 percent). Focus group participants as well as former subscribers agreed, commenting on AHM’s ability to inspire interest in Arizona travel destinations and to effectively engage with readers through the quality of its photography, stories, and monthly features, and the authenticity of its writing. Collectively, these distinguishing attributes were described as the value differentiator that sets AHM apart from its competitors.

AHM is a preferred source for travel information and meets the expectations of its readers.

A significant majority of current subscribers (79 percent) stated that AHM is their preferred, go-to resource for Arizona travel information, and nearly three-quarters (70 percent) reported that it is their Arizona travel guide. Among former subscribers, 28 percent reported that use of AHM as a travel planning guide was the reason they had subscribed to the magazine, offering such comments as, “You’re doing a good job. It’s a great magazine. Unfortunately, I no longer live in Arizona or visit there enough to use the magazine as a travel guide.”

Feedback from focus group participants provided additional insights into how readers use travel information resources, with most describing AHM as the catalyst driving their decision to travel and their starting point for trip planning. AHM was described as “setting the tone” for travel, providing a credible and reliable source for information. Participants noted they often use the magazine to supplement information obtained through destination-specific resources or websites that contain a
wealth of logistical details that they believe are likely not feasible for AHM to include in the magazine (e.g., National Parks website information). Participants’ description of AHM as a travel guide that is somewhat “limited in scope” was not perceived as a drawback or an impediment to readers’ use of the magazine as a travel guide.

**Theme 3: Subscriber Esteem and Loyalty**

Subscribers spoke of AHM as Arizona’s definitive magazine.

Nearly all AHM subscribers reported that they are devoted fans of the magazine, and that they look forward to receiving their monthly issue (95 and 96 percent, respectively). One individual commented, “My subscription to AHM is now going on continuously since 1948. Keep up the good work.”

The vast majority of subscribers (90 percent) agreed that AHM is at the top of their list for “must have” magazine subscriptions. During the focus groups, subscribers spoke of AHM as Arizona’s “definitive magazine,” and more than half the participants in one group noted that it is the only magazine they subscribe to. The following comment from one participant elicited enthusiastic agreement from the rest of the group: “You have to have something that speaks to the rest of the world, for a particular region. If it’s not this magazine, then what is it in Arizona?”

AHM is ingrained in the childhood memories of many readers, who recall reading the magazine with their family.

Half of all current subscribers (50 percent) reported that AHM is a family tradition shared with children, grandchildren, and other family members. Both current and former subscribers as well as focus group participants referenced memories of time spent enthusiastically reviewing the magazine with family and the lasting impression that AHM had made on them. In addition, more than three-quarters (78 percent) of subscribers stated that AHM allows them to share the Arizona travel experience with others, and slightly less than three-quarters (74 percent) stated that giving or receiving a subscription to AHM is a great way to share one’s love for Arizona’s iconic beauty, history, and culture. “My aunt and uncle subscribed to Arizona Highways. As a child I would go to their home, and I would spend hours sitting there, just fascinated with what I saw and what I learned.”

Current subscribers (both survey respondents and focus group participants) also expressed interest in seeing AHM take deliberate steps to improve and expand its appeal to the next generation of readers, specifically school-age children. Subscribers viewed this as an opportunity for AHM to further its mission, engage with a market segment that has considerable influence in family decision-making.
matters such as travel, and inspire stewardship. Suggestions included improvements to the AHM website, such as providing more interactive and kid-friendly content, and AHM publication of a youth magazine (or a special AHM edition published once or twice a year) that could potentially be marketed to schools as well as the general public.

Theme 4: Subscriber Engagement and Purchasing Behaviors

Current and former subscribers consider themselves satisfied with AHM, and the vast majority of current subscribers plan to renew.

Both current and former subscribers reported overall satisfaction with the magazine—86 percent of current subscribers stated that they have had a positive customer experience when purchasing or renewing their subscription and, as noted earlier, 88 percent of former subscribers reported overall satisfaction with AHM. Nearly all current subscribers plan to renew their subscription and believe they are getting their money’s worth in subscribing to AHM (97 and 96 percent, respectively).

Subscribers’ engagement with AHM was also evident in their reported use of AHM tools, such as the website and, to a far lesser extent, the Facebook Page and blog.

- As noted earlier, more than three-quarters (78 percent) of current subscriber survey respondents reported using the AHM website. Among former subscribers, 65 percent reported using the site while their subscription was active, and 38 percent after their subscription had expired.

- One-quarter (25 percent) of current subscriber survey respondents reported using the Facebook Page. Among former subscribers, 15 percent reported using the Page while their subscription was active, and 7 percent after their subscription had expired.

- Slightly more than one-tenth (11 percent) of current subscriber survey respondents reported using the AHM blog. Among former subscribers, 15 percent reported using the blog while their subscription was active, and 7 percent after their subscription had expired.

When asked about their catalyst for subscribing, current subscribers were nearly evenly divided in reporting that they had initially begun their subscription by responding to an offer or by purchasing one or more issues before deciding to subscribe (36 and 33 percent, respectively).
Nearly two-thirds of current subscribers (64 percent) stated that *AHM* products make great gifts for family, friends, and colleagues, and slightly more than half (52 percent) said they would likely purchase one or more *AHM* products this year. However, the reported intention of current subscribers to purchase *AHM* gift subscriptions this year was low, with slightly more than one-third (34 percent) indicating that they would likely do so.

When former subscribers were asked about their purchases of *AHM* store merchandise, 40 percent reported having made one or more purchases while their subscription was active, and 15 percent after their subscription had expired.

**Theme 5: Subscriber Reading Behaviors and Preferences**

Some subscribers read the magazine in multiple sittings as time permits, while a similar percentage immediately flip through the magazine upon receipt and then put it aside to read at a later time (38 and 37 percent, respectively). The majority (62 percent) reported spending at least one hour reading the magazine, with no difference by age group.

Over three-fourths (77 percent) of survey respondents reported that during the course of a typical month, one to two other people in the household read or looked through their copy of *AHM*.

The subscriber survey asked respondents to rate their interest in specific topics within a variety of areas, including monthly features, outdoor activities, photography, and travel. The findings are summarized below.

- Interest in monthly features was consistent across all demographics, with “Scenic Drive” at the top of the list (85 percent extremely interested), followed by “The Journal” (70 percent), “Hike of the Month” (59 percent), and “Where Is This?” (49 percent).
• Content preferences for outdoor activities included a predominance of interest in scenic drives (76 percent extremely interested), followed by hiking and backpacking (38 percent), and camping (25 percent).

• Photography subjects of primary interest included landscapes (88 percent extremely interested) and wildlife (79 percent).

• Interest was similar for travel-related content regarding restaurants (64 percent extremely interested) and lodging facilities (58 percent).

• Interest in AHM content in other subject areas was greatest for Arizona history (78 percent extremely interested), nature (72 percent), and culture (63 percent). Both current and former subscribers suggested adding more content regarding Arizona history and human interest stories that spotlight different areas or regions of the state. Additionally, slightly more than half of all subscribers reported being extremely interested in content related to the environment (54 percent) and science (50 percent).

Public interest stories are perceived as aligning with AHM’s mission to raise awareness of issues impacting the state.

While 70 percent of survey respondents expressed some interest in public interest stories, 35 percent rated their interest level as “extremely interested” and 35 percent as “interested.” This difference is notable because in all other content areas, the majority of survey respondents reported their interest as “extremely interested.”

The topic of public interest stories was extensively explored with focus group participants, nearly all of whom stated the belief that it is very important for AHM to feature public interest stories and that these stories should appear in the magazine as “noteworthy and relevant issues present themselves,” rather than adhering to an arbitrary editorial schedule. These stories were also viewed as important and valuable, providing credible information that presents both sides of an issue and informing and educating readers about the potential impact of the particular environmental, cultural, or societal issue. Subscribers emphasized the need for AHM to present public issue stories in an interesting and thought-provoking manner, remain neutral in its position and presentation of the facts, and refrain from political commentary (i.e., not stoke the fires of controversy). Readers were also clear in stating that they expect nothing less from AHM than tastefully written, informative, and educational public interest stories.

The following comment from one individual aptly sums up subscriber views on AHM’s role in providing public interest stories:

“I think that Arizona Highways, just because of the type of magazine that it is, gives a credible voice and a good forum to be able to address issues like this. I am a lot more likely to take an
issue seriously or to look at what they say as opposed to looking at it in *Phoenix Magazine* or even the newspaper because I can tell . . . that they care about Arizona. They care about having a future place for our children, for our grandchildren. They’re invested.”

**Subscriber interest in feature stories is piqued by topic and overall visual appeal; length of the story is generally irrelevant.**

Subscriber preferences regarding the length of feature stories were explored in detail with focus group participants. Their motivation to read a story, regardless of its length, was directly influenced by their interest in the topic and the appeal of the layout—the title, accompanying photography, general content, and overall visual design. For the vast majority, the length of the story is not relevant. When asked about specific topics of interest or the types of stories they would like to see included, focus group participants reiterated comments provided by subscriber and former subscriber survey respondents regarding their interest in more human interest stories that profile the people, places, and backdrops that contribute to Arizona’s diverse history and culture.

**Most survey respondents and focus group participants were unaware that AHM offers a digital version.**

Survey respondents expressed differing views of digital subscriptions, but most of their comments expressed interest in a combined print and digital subscription being included in *AHM* offerings.

Focus group participants voiced a distinct preference for print formats, with the majority of subscribers identifying this reading experience as more closely aligned with their needs and preferences. They cited such factors as the:

- Tactile sensory enjoyment of flipping through the magazine or marking up the margins with notes
- Utility of being able to bring *AHM* with them when traveling (especially in areas with limited cell phone and Internet signals or service) or to more easily share the magazine with others
- Need to disconnect from the technologies that consume their work life or leisure time; these subscribers also strongly expressed the hope that *AHM* would not change to a totally digital format.
Theme 6: Subscriber Suggestions for Improvement

Through the use of an open-ended question—“What can AHM do better?”—current and former subscriber survey respondents were invited to provide suggestions to improve the quality of the magazine, the reader experience, and ways in which AHM could increase subscriptions and renewals. Approximately half (48 percent) of current subscribers stated that AHM should not change anything and that they love the magazine the way it is. Other respondents offered suggestions for improvement in content, marketing, and customer outreach that included the following:

Content

- Expand photography information to include more technical information, tips and hints, and articles by photographers on photography basics.

- Feature more stories related to: (a) Arizona’s history, people, and cultures; human interest stories that provide an in-depth, personal look at life in Arizona, including Native American culture and history; (b) travel feature stories, including economy travel options, in-depth information about lodging and restaurants; and (c) local or regional events. It was also suggested that AHM periodically feature humorous articles.

- Feature more family and kid-focused activities to appeal to a broader market; improve the quality of the kid’s section on the website; and create a publication (or special editions) for youth.

- Expand information on favorite outdoor activities—hiking, back-country trips, camping, and biking—and add stories on other activities, such as skiing, boating, off-roading, and fishing.

Marketing

- Raise awareness of AHM’s mission and educate the public to eliminate misconceptions about its funding.

- Expand marketing efforts to: (a) include digital subscription offers and/or a combined digital/print subscription offer; (b) increase awareness of AHM merchandise; and (c) promote to subscribers and website visitors the offerings of AHM publications, products, and services (e.g., monthly newsletter).

Customer Outreach

- Address concerns expressed about the: (a) renewal process, such as the need for more reminders prior to termination, offering automatic renewal, and enabling customers to go online and check their subscription status; (b) amount of time between ordering and receipt of product; and (c) subscription rates, such as offering varying price points, renewal rewards, price breaks for longtime subscribers, or “buy two, get one free” promotions for subscription purchases.
• Engage in timely follow-up with lost customers, such as sending a survey shortly after a subscriber cancels or lets subscription expire.

• Implement offers and benefits that could positively influence customer retention. When former subscribers were asked to identify AHM benefits or offers that would cause them to seriously reconsider subscribing again, the majority (63 percent) identified the ability to purchase or renew their subscription at a discounted rate. This was followed by 15 percent who wanted the ability to purchase a digital subscription to AHM at a discounted rate and 13 percent who wanted to receive subscriber-only book offers.
RECOMMENDATIONS

Following extensive analysis of the quantitative and qualitative data obtained in the study, recommendations were developed and presented to the AHM staff to aid planning efforts. These recommendations, which included suggested action steps, were organized into the following key areas of focus:

- Meeting expectations: AHM readers’ primary interests
- Enhancing content: AHM as the go-to resource for Arizona travel information
- Expanding marketing and promotion efforts
- Improving the AHM customer service experience
- Staying attuned to reader needs and preferences

Top-Priority Recommendations

The AHM staff identified several recommendations as key priorities for implementation; these recommendations are presented below.

1. **Continue to foster Arizona tourism by exploring opportunities for AHM to provide supplemental information of high interest to readers, using the AHM website as the primary vehicle for informing the public.**

   This recommendation supports AHM’s marketing goal of ensuring that the AHM website actively supports and facilitates subscriber acquisition and retention efforts—the underpinning of all AHM marketing efforts. From an implementation planning perspective, this recommendation can best be classified as mid-term to long-term.

   - Explore opportunities to fill gaps in the information that can feasibly be included in the magazine with value-added information and services, such as providing readers website links to destination-specific resources or providing call-outs in stories that direct readers to other information sources, including internal AHM resources and external information sources.
   - Increase the number of feature stories related to travel and include more information regarding: (a) suggested detailed itineraries, (b) must-see places and things to do, (c)
amount of time to allot when visiting various destinations, and (d) historical or background information.

- Feature more stories that provide information on economy travel options, such as budget-friendly lodging and restaurant suggestions.

- Provide more in-depth information on lodging and restaurants, including maps, accommodations available to visitors, and how and why places were selected for inclusion in the magazine.

- Consider outreach to AHM website visitors and subscribers to invite their participation in content development by suggesting itineraries, must-do places to visit and related activities, etc.

2. **Leverage online and social media tools to actively promote AHM products and services; consider bundling offers, such as a combined print/digital subscription.**

   This recommendation supports AHM’s long-term effort to effectively deploy the use of various media and promotional offers to engage, attract, acquire, and retain subscribers.

   **Suggested Action Steps**

   - Use the social networking sites favored by AHM subscribers to connect with them and reach potential subscribers. These include Facebook, YouTube, LinkedIn, and Pinterest, followed by Google Plus and Instagram.

   - Use the AHM website and social media to continue promotion of newsstand purchases (e.g., “On newsstands now” banner). Look for opportunities to test and expand newsstand presence in markets most likely to include the age 45–54 reader demographic, because survey findings revealed that nearly half (46 percent) of subscribers ages 45 to 54 purchased single issues prior to subscribing to AHM.

   - Develop and aggressively market to consumers a dual-subscription (print and digital) offer, remaining mindful of reader preferences to retain the AHM print format (i.e., readers do not want AHM available in only a digital format).

   - To correspond with AHM’s 100th birthday celebration, explore opportunities to engage readers in campaigns that inform and educate the public about AHM’s mission and funding—i.e., the pivotal role that subscribers play in ensuring the solvency and longevity of the magazine.
3. Develop and implement a research protocol to assess the influence of AHM on state tourism, consumer perceptions of AHM products and services, and/or other related indicators of the effectiveness of AHM in fulfilling its mission and meeting reader expectations.

This research-centered recommendation addresses the fundamental need to regularly assess and evaluate the effectiveness of Arizona Highways magazine in meeting its intended purpose.

**Suggested Action Steps**

- Conduct research and assessments on a regular basis to gauge effectiveness, trends in reader interests and attitudes, and shifts in purchasing behaviors (e.g., economic impact study, subscriber and former subscriber perceptions of AHM products, and analysis of subscription and renewal rates).

- Periodically conduct online and/or in-person discussion groups with AHM subscribers and former subscribers.

- Invite AHM subscribers and AHM website visitors to join an online consumer panel. Develop a database of the panel members and use it to conduct periodic polls regarding concept or new product testing, public interest issues with potential impact on state tourism, and critical editorial or design topics to inform and aid AHM decision making.

- Develop an exit survey and invite subscribers who have not renewed their AHM subscription to complete the survey.

**Second-Tier Recommendations**

To assist in implementation planning, the remaining recommendations are presented in a staging sequence reflective of resource considerations and the amount of time likely needed to achieve full implementation. These recommendations are classified as able to be implemented in either the short, mid, or long term; definitions of those classifications are as follows:

- **Short-term** – actions that are currently in effect and ongoing or can likely be implemented within the next year with existing AHM resources and staff

- **Mid-term** – actions that may require additional staffing and financial resources, may involve cooperation and coordination with external partners, and are likely to require one to three years to implement

- **Long-term** – actions that will require additional staffing, financial resources, and extensive cooperation and coordination with external partners and are likely to require more than three years to implement
Short-Term Implementation

4. Feature more stories about and devote more pages to subscriber favorites, such as: (a) photography; (b) AHM monthly features; and (c) human interest stories. Also continue to fulfill AHM’s mission by featuring public interest stories.

- Retain the integrity of the AHM brand and its world-acclaimed photography by providing AHM readers more photography-related content such as: (a) technical information, including tips and hints from professionals; (b) articles on the basics, written by photographers; and (c) photography workshops.

- Continue to focus on AHM monthly features of greatest interest to subscribers: Scenic Drive, The Journal, Hike of the Month, and Where Is This?

- Include more human interest stories that profile the people, places, and backdrops that contribute to Arizona’s diverse history and culture.

- Continue to feature public interest stories that are thought-provoking, informative, educational, and tastefully written. Adhere to reader preferences that AHM remain neutral in its position, present both sides of the issue, and refrain from political commentary. Consider soliciting feedback from AHM readers and AHM website visitors on topics for stories as well as suggestions for additional public interest topics that they would like to see AHM address.

5. Cross-promote AHM products by capitalizing on the strong affinity that readers have for the AHM brand.

- Continue to actively promote the sale of AHM publications and products via other AHM channels, including the website (78 percent of subscribers report having used or visited it), AHM Facebook Page, and the AHM store, and promote monthly newsletter sign-up.

- Provide call-outs in articles or stories to other AHM publications and products that correlate with the monthly issue theme (e.g., AHM digital publications, travel guides, other products), using a soft-sell and value-added approach.
• Develop subscriber-only product bundling offers (e.g., pair *AHM* publications that spotlight regional attractions with state guides for the region, such as pairing Arizona Highways Scenic Drives with Wildlife Guide: 125 of Arizona’s Native Species or Arizona’s Best Recipes).

• Expand the use of magazine-wrapper advertising to introduce subscribers to *AHM* products.

• Develop innovative ways to engage and connect with *AHM* subscribers through “meet and greet” events or an annual event in which the public can interact directly with the *AHM* publisher and team (e.g., book signing, special landmark celebration, or product launch events).

6. **Improve *AHM* order and fulfillment processes, invite customer feedback regarding service delivery, reward subscribers for their continued patronage, and identify strategies to reduce churn rates.**

   **Suggested Action Steps**

   • Continually work to identify process and procedural improvements to enhance the order entry, fulfillment, and customer service processes that support *AHM*’s commitment to superior customer service.

   • Address customer concerns regarding order and fulfillment processing (e.g., renewal via *AHM* website, delay experienced in receiving subscription).

   • Promote automatic renewal offers and discounted subscription rate offers to reward continued patronage.

   • Inform subscribers of self-service options available to them by providing their email address (e.g., online access to their subscription status).

   • Invite customers to participate in a brief telephone or online survey at the conclusion of their customer service transaction.

   • Develop a series of communications to solicit feedback regarding their *AHM* customer experience from subscribers whose subscriptions have expired or are about to expire.
Mid-Term Implementation

7. Periodically assess user satisfaction with their AHM website experience and address any concerns regarding website content and usage.

- Investigate opportunities to enhance the overall AHM customer experience, such as features and functionality of the AHM website that will provide a more intuitive and user-friendly experience (e.g., navigation, search capability).
- Improve internet search capabilities so AHM website comes to the top of a search results list.
- Improve the AHM subscription renewal function.
- Conduct brief polls regarding satisfaction with the AHM website and the overall user experience.
- Expand opportunities to upsell and cross-sell AHM products via use of the AHM website.

Long-Term Implementation

8. Promote AHM to the next generation of readers by expanding the use of the website and social media to include more family-friendly content; explore possibility of developing a special edition or new publication geared toward youth.

- Include more magazine, website, and social media content that is specifically geared to the interests of young families and children.
- To assess potential interest and identify topics of interest to this audience, conduct a series of polls through the AHM website and AHM Facebook Page or explore opportunities to conduct a research study on strategies for reaching the next generation of AHM readers (e.g., family readership: products geared to young children, tweens and teens, and young adults).
• Expand the use of AHM social media (e.g., Facebook, Twitter, Tumblr, and Instagram) to engage families and children.

• Improve and expand content available on the “For Kids” tab of the AHM website.

9. **Explore opportunities to develop and expand content geared toward families and children, including expanded outreach via product promotions.**

• Consider developing a “For Kids Only” addendum to the magazine that complements content presented on the “For Kids” AHM website tab.

• Consider developing stand-alone (annual) or subscription (semi-annual, quarterly) AHM publication(s) geared toward different youth age ranges (e.g., children, tweens, teens) and market as an ideal gift for children and grandchildren.

• Explore opportunities to get AHM into schools by promoting the magazine to teachers (e.g., providing special online mini-edition, downloadable teacher lesson plans and classroom activities on AHM website, etc.).

This research study has provided information regarding the reading preferences and behaviors of AHM subscribers, as well as insights into the attitudes and opinions held by both current and former subscribers concerning the magazine and the AHM brand. Study findings provide insights into customer engagement, loyalty, and the propensity to purchase—all indicators of the extent to which individuals are likely to remain loyal subscribers to Arizona Highways magazine.
APPENDIX A

SUBSCRIBER SURVEY FINDINGS

PRESENTED OCTOBER 16, 2015
Objectives

- Obtain information from AHM subscribers regarding reader habits, interest in AHM editorial content – including monthly features and other subject content areas, and reader views and perceptions regarding the AHM subscriber experience.
- Provide the AHM team information that aids and enriches understanding of the AHM subscriber
  - Demographics
  - How they first began subscription to AHM
  - General reading habits
  - Interest in AHM content areas
  - Use of AHM media tools
  - Perceived influence of AHM on travel
  - Insights regarding affinity and brand loyalty, subscriber engagement and purchasing behaviors, perceived value of subscription, inherent trust in AHM brand, and plans to renew subscription
  - Other relevant information enabling better understanding of AHM subscriber (e.g., lifestyle, technology devices used, subscription to other magazines)
  - Subscriber feedback on “what AHM can do better”

AHM Recruitment Lists and Methodology

- Recruitment lists
  - AHM subscriber lists (self-subscribers in Arizona and other states)
  - Criteria used:
    - Exclude non-U.S. mailing addresses
    - Exclude complimentary subscriptions
    - Exclude “Do not rent” counts
    - Exclude subscribers who have received fewer than 6 issues
  - AHM lists segmented by number of issues received and coded to reflect list source: 7-35 issues, 37-60 issues, and 61+ issues
- Online survey fielding period
  - Soft-launch: July 15, 2015
  - Survey close date: July 31, 2015
- Incentive to participate
  - Discount code for AHM product purchases through December 31, 2015 (35%)
  - Entry in drawing for AHM gift basket (selected products, valued at over $200)
Analysis of Survey Response

- Recruitment subscriber file counts: mail-only address records and records containing both mailing address and e-mail address
  - AHM list count: 40,929 (58% mailing address; 42% mail/e-mail address)
- E-mail file recruitment strategy used to support survey
  - AHM list count: 17,091
  - Responses needed (95% confidence level and 5% margin of error): 376
- Survey results
  - Actual number of completed surveys: 897
  - Survey response rate: 5%
- Representative sample of AHM subscriber file
  - As presented on next slide, analysis of completed surveys by list source reveals that response is representative of target audience of AHM subscribers

Recruitment and Response by List Source

E-mail Recruitment List Counts (N = 17,091)
- 36 issues: N = 6,367
- 60 issues: N = 1,167
- 61 issues: N = 8,557

Completed Surveys (N = 897)
- 36 issues: N = 275
- 60 issues: N = 117
- 61 issues: N = 505
Demographics: Survey Respondents

- Gender: 62% male
- Age — representation by age group:
  - 18-34: 12%
  - 35-64: 29%
  - 65-74: 43%
  - 75 and older: 16%
  - 88% age 55 and older
  - Average age: 65 (males: 66 years; females: 63 years)
- Marital status: 78% married
- Employment status: 61% retired and not working; 36% currently employed
- Education: 74% have college degree
- Household income: Slightly more than half (55%) reported income of $50K or more; 33% reported income less than $50K; 12% preferred not to answer
- Residency: 64% (576) live in Arizona (FT or PT); average number of years living in Arizona: 14
  - Live in Arizona less than 10 years: 33%; 10-19 years: 30%; 20 or more years: 37%
  - Out-of-state respondents primarily from: CA, HI, WI, MI, TX, WA, PA, OH, MO, CO, FL, OR, and IL

Largest segment of subscribers reporting other magazine subscriptions were those ages 55–64 and 65 and older (70% and 75%, respectively)

- 75% (671) of subscribers subscribe to other print or digital magazines. Major magazine content categories included:
  - Food/home/decors/lifestyle/health/beauty (approximately 38%)
  - Travel/outdoors/regional/nature (approximately 33%)
  - History/culture/archaeology (approximately 29%)
- Top magazines included National Geographic, Smithsonian, Sunset, and Time
  - While the sample sizes for these age groups were low, a significant number of respondents ages 18-34 (5 of 7) and respondents ages 55-59 (51 of 70), or 73% reported other magazine subscriptions.
  - However, the figure was significantly lower (16 of 30, or 53%) among respondents ages 35-44. A full list of magazine titles is available.
All subscribers use one or more technology devices; device usage clearly differs by age group

- Statistically significant higher percentage of subscribers ages 65+ than those 35-64 use a cell phone (50% and 32%, respectively).
- Statistically significant higher percentage of subscribers ages 65+ than those 35-64 use e-reader devices (38% and 26%, respectively).
- Statistically significant higher percentage of subscribers ages 35-64 than those 65 or older use smartphone (73% and 56%, respectively).
- Use of desktop or laptop computers consistent across all age groups (approximately 95%).

Technology devices regularly used (cont’d)

- Approximately half of subscribers in each age group use a tablet, except for those ages 75 and older (35%).
- Use of e-readers highest among subscribers ages 75+ (40%), and higher among the collective group of respondents ages 65 and older (38%) than those ages 35-64 (26%).
Majority (68%) of subscribers use one or more social networking sites; top sites are Facebook, YouTube, LinkedIn

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Facebook N = 418</th>
<th>YouTube N = 277</th>
<th>LinkedIn N = 198</th>
<th>Pinterest N = 107</th>
<th>Google Plus N = 86</th>
<th>Instagram N = 57</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18-34</td>
<td>57% (4)</td>
<td>43% (4)</td>
<td>29% (2)</td>
<td>14% (2)</td>
<td>29% (2)</td>
<td>29% (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-64</td>
<td>51% (277)</td>
<td>38% (198)</td>
<td>31% (107)</td>
<td>16% (86)</td>
<td>8% (57)</td>
<td>10% (57)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65-74</td>
<td>53% (318)</td>
<td>27% (198)</td>
<td>16% (107)</td>
<td>10% (86)</td>
<td>8% (57)</td>
<td>5% (57)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75+</td>
<td>40% (147)</td>
<td>21% (107)</td>
<td>14% (86)</td>
<td>5% (57)</td>
<td>15% (57)</td>
<td>1% (57)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Use of Flickr, Tumblr, and Vine was extremely low, with less than 3% of subscribers in each age group reporting use.
- Non-use of social networking sites was highest among subscribers age 65 and older and those 55-64 (37% and 28%, respectively).

Over half of all subscribers in each group use Facebook

Percentage of Subscribers Using Social Networks, by Age Group

- Facebook
- YouTube
- LinkedIn
- Pinterest

PARTNERS IN BRAINSTORMS
BEYOND THE SUCCESSS

29
Length of AHM subscription (self-reported) and data regarding number of issues received (AHM list source)

How long have you subscribed to AHM? (self-reported)

Years Subscribing to AHM

- 1-2 yrs: 47%
- 3-5 yrs: 16%
- 5-9 yrs: 19%
- 10+ yrs: 17%

AHM list source: length of subscription (fulfillment file records)

Issues Received

- 2-36 issues: 56%
- 37-60 issues: 31%
- 61+ issues: 13%

Majority of subscribers originally responded to subscription offer or purchased single AHM issues before subscribing; statistically significant higher percentage of subscribers ages 45-54 (46%) purchased single issues.

AHM Subscription Source (Self-reported) Percentage of All Respondents

- Responded to subscription offer: 36%
- Purchased single issues before subscribing (newsstand): 33%
- Don't know or do not recall: 20%
- Received AHM gift subscription: 11%
Significant majority of subscribers use AHM website; use of AHM Facebook Page and AHM Blog dramatically less (25% and 11%, respectively)

![Bar Chart]

Significant majority of subscribers reported that 1-2 other people in household read or look through their copy of AHM during typical month

![Pie Chart]
Subscribers tend to read AHM in multiple sittings or immediately scan monthly issue upon receipt before putting it aside (38% and 37%, respectively).

Majority of subscribers (62%) spend one or more hours reading AHM; no major differences by age group.
Subscriber Interests

- Subscribers asked to rate their interest in AHM monthly features and content areas using a 10-point scale, where 1 was not at all interested and 10 was extremely interested.
- Most interested in:
  - Monthly features: Scenic Drive, The Journal, Hike of the Month
  - Content/outdoor activities: Scenic drives, hiking and backpacking, camping
  - Photography subjects: landscapes, wildlife
  - Travel: both restaurants and lodging
  - Other subject areas: history, nature, culture
Detailed Look at Subscriber Interest in Specific Monthly Features

Percentage of Subscribers
Does not include, “Unable to Rate”

- Scenic Drive: N=883
  - Rating 9-10: 85
  - Rating 7-8: 70
  - Rating 4-6: 59
  - Rating 1-3: 49

- The Journal: N=890
  - Rating 9-10: 24
  - Rating 7-8: 22
  - Rating 4-6: 14
  - Rating 1-3: 28

- Hike of the Month: N=882
  - Rating 9-10: 2
  - Rating 7-8: 5
  - Rating 4-6: 5
  - Rating 1-3: 18

- Where Is This?: N=885
  - Rating 9-10: 5
  - Rating 7-8: 1
  - Rating 4-6: 5
  - Rating 1-3: 1

Ratings scale: 1-10 (not at all interested to extremely interested)

Detailed Look at Subscriber Interest in Specific Monthly Features (cont’d)

Percentage of Subscribers
Does not include, “Unable to Rate”

- Editor’s Letter: N=885
  - Rating 9-10: 24
  - Rating 7-8: 29
  - Rating 4-6: 18
  - Rating 1-3: 18

- Letters to Editor: N=891
  - Rating 9-10: 24
  - Rating 7-8: 29
  - Rating 4-6: 31
  - Rating 1-3: 18

- Contributors—Bios: N=889
  - Rating 9-10: 32
  - Rating 7-8: 38
  - Rating 4-6: 30
  - Rating 1-3: 19

Ratings scale: 1-10 (not at all interested to extremely interested)
Subscriber Interest in AHM Content on Outdoor Activities

Summary of Means

Rating scales: 1–10 (not at all interested to extremely interested)

Detailed Look at Subscriber Interest in AHM Content on Outdoor Activities

Percentage of Subscribers
N = 897

Rating scales: 1–10 (not at all interested to extremely interested)
Detailed Look at Subscriber Interest in AHM Content on Outdoor Activities (cont’d)

Percentage of Subscribers
N = 897

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Rating 9-10</th>
<th>Rating 7-8</th>
<th>Rating 4-6</th>
<th>Rating 1-3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Water activities</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Road cycling/mountain biking</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horseback riding</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rating scales: 1–10 (not at all interested to extremely interested)

Subscriber Interest in AHM Photography

Summary of Means

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Landscapes</td>
<td>9.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wildlife</td>
<td>9.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macro</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People</td>
<td>8.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rating scales: 1–10 (not at all interested to extremely interested)
Subscriber Interest in AHM Travel-Related Content on Restaurants and Lodging

Percentage of Subscribers
N = 897

- Restaurants:
  - Rating 9-10: 64
  - Rating 7-8: 24
  - Rating 6-4: 11
  - Rating 1-3: 2

- Lodging:
  - Rating 9-10: 58
  - Rating 7-8: 26
  - Rating 6-4: 11
  - Rating 1-3: 3

Rating scale: 1-10 (not at all interested to extremely interested)

Subscriber Interest in AHM Content in Other Subject Areas

Summary of Means

- History: 9.1
- Nature: 9
- Culture: 8.6
- Science: 8.2
- Environment: 8.1
- Public Issues: 7.4

Rating scale: 1-20 (not at all interested to extremely interested)
## Influence and Impact of AHM

### Arizona Travel & Tourism

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agreement Statements</th>
<th>N = 1087</th>
<th>Agree 1-10 Rating</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AHM is my preferred source for Arizona travel information.</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHM has influenced my choice of travel destinations in Arizona.</td>
<td>88%</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHM has motivated me to take day trips to Arizona travel destinations.</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHM has motivated me to take multi-day trips to Arizona travel destinations or to vacation in Arizona.</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHM is my Arizona travel guide.</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Subscriber Loyalty & Affinity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agreement Statements</th>
<th>N = 1087</th>
<th>Agree 1-10 Rating</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I am a devoted fan of Arizona Highways magazine.</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHM is at the top of my list for &quot;must have&quot; magazine subscriptions.</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I look forward to receiving my monthly issue of AHM.</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I save and/or collect issues of AHM.</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHM allows me to share the Arizona travel experience with others.</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Influence and Impact of AHM

### Subscriber Engagement/Purchasing Behavior

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agreement Statements</th>
<th>N = 1087</th>
<th>Agree 1-10 Rating</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AHM is a family tradition shared with children, grandchildren, and/or other family members.</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giving or renewing a subscription to AHM is a great way to share one's love for Arizona's iconic beauty, history, and culture.</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHM products make great gifts for family, friends, and colleagues.</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I will likely purchase one or more AHM gift subscriptions this year.</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I will likely purchase one or more AHM products this year.</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Subscriber Experience/Promoter Profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agreement Statements</th>
<th>N = 1087</th>
<th>Agree 1-10 Rating</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I have had a positive customer experience when purchasing or renewing my subscription to AHM.</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel as though I am getting my money's worth by subscribing to AHM.</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The AHM brand is a brand that I trust — whether subscribing to the magazine or purchasing an AHM guidebook, I know that I can count on the AHM name for a quality publication.</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would recommend AHM to others.</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I plan to renew my subscription to AHM.</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Feedback on AHM Customer Experience

"In the previous question, you indicated that you did not strongly agree... Please tell us why."

Asked of subscribers who did not strongly agree with each of the following statements (rated 1-6 on a 10-point Likert, where 10 is strongly agree)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Customer Experience</th>
<th>Analysis of Response</th>
<th>Subscriber Feedback</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| "I have had a positive customer experience when purchasing or renewing my subscription to AHM." | Approximately 22 respondents provided comments.  
Several stated they had answered the question incorrectly, and did not have a negative experience. | Difficulty with online renewal payment option.  
Purchased at special rate but billed at going rate.  
Interested in multi-year subscription (renewal); cannot get information. |
| "I would recommend AHM to others." | Approximately 100 respondents.  
Approximately 20% stated that they would recommend AHM to others. ("I've used Arizona Magazine. I would recommend it, maybe I just didn't put strongly agree, just agree.") | General reluctance to recommend items of interest to others.  
Perceived non-interest in Arizona or Southwest. |
| "I plan to renew my subscription to AHM." | Approximately 56 respondents.  
Slightly more than one-third stated that they did plan to renew their subscription. | AHM subscription rates, cost of AHM products (including S/H).  
Shopping around for best rate.  
Personal finances/budget.  
Likelihood—I'll be cutting back on number of subscriptions.  
Do not have enough time to read magazines. |

What Can AHM Do Better?

"What suggestions do you have to improve the quality of Arizona Highways magazine, or to increase AHM subscriptions or renewals?"

- Don't change anything (approximately 48% of respondents).
- Provide additional information about photos (e.g., technical information, hints, articles by photographers on photography basics).
- Feature more historical content—articles and historical photos.
- Include more travel feature stories (e.g., suggested and detailed itineraries, must see places and things to do, time to allot, historical and background information).
- Provide information and feature stories on "economy travel" options for readers (e.g., less expensive lodging options, budget-friendly and affordable hotels and restaurants).
- Provide more information on hiking, back country trips, camping and biking.
- Feature stories on local/regional events and festivals (e.g., art and wine festivals, community days, rodeos).
- Expand outdoor activities (e.g., skiing, boating, off-roading, fishing).
What Can AHM Do Better? (cont’d)

- Devote more pages to Native American culture and history.
- Introduce more humor stories (e.g., humor section, short humorous articles).
- More in-depth information when highlighting lodging and restaurant selections, including how and why chosen (e.g., maps, accommodations—vegan or vegetarian menu options).
- Feature more family and kid-focused activities to appeal to a broader market.
- Availability of AHM on iPad (e.g., like other magazines at no extra charge or dual-pack cheaper price for an online/print subscription).
- Technical improvements (e.g., concerns related to difficulty reading type—font size too small, use of ink color does not provide adequate contrast).
- Improve order and fulfillment processing (e.g., renewal website difficulties, lag/delay between ordering and receipt of subscription).

What Can AHM Do Better? (cont’d)

- Address concerns regarding subscription rates (e.g., varying price points, think about offering price breaks for longtime subscribers or renewal rewards, or “buy two, get one free” offers to promote subscription purchases).
- Explore creative marketing strategies.
  - Place copies of AHM in hospital waiting rooms, birthing centers, maternity and other waiting rooms (“Pitch to administrators—AHM in ER and intensive care units—AHM is a great stress reliever...hey, AHM as a therapy protocol... that’s a winner,”)
  - Promote AHM as a travel supplement (“Don’t get too big for your britches as a “primary” travel guide – too expensive to keep current. BUT, absolutely pitch your material as a great way to improve the travel experience, a travel supplement sort of.”)
Respondent Interest in Focus Groups: “Would you be interested in participating in an upcoming in-person group discussion about Arizona Highways magazine? In total, 219 (24%) of all survey respondents expressed interest.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interest by promoter profile – likelihood to recommend AHM</th>
<th>Interested in focus group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Promoters</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passives</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detractors</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interest by list source – number of issues received</th>
<th>Interested in focus group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List 51: 7-36 issues (AZ)</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List 52: 7-36 issues (Other state)</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List 53: 37-60 issues (AZ)</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List 54: 37-60 issues (Other state)</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List 55: 61+ issues (AZ)</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List 56: 61+ issues (Other state)</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Analysis by Promoter Profile – Likelihood to Recommend AHM to Others

- **AHM Promoters, Passives, Detractors**

  - **Net promoter score** is used to define the loyalty of a firm’s customers.
  - **Survey participants** were asked to rate the extent to which they agreed with this statement, “I would recommend AHM to others” using a 10-point scale, where 10 is “strongly agree.”
  - **Promoters (rated 9 or 10)**
    - Loyal enthusiasts who will keep buying and refer others
    - **86% (770) of the 897 subscriber respondents are AHM promoters**
  - **Passives (rated 7 or 8)**
    - Satisfied but unenthusiastic customers who are vulnerable to competitive offerings
    - 12% (104) of subscriber respondents are AHM passives
  - **Detractors (rated 6 or less)**
    - Unhappy customers who can damage the brand and impede growth through negative word of mouth
    - 3% (23) of subscriber respondents are AHM detractors
  - **AHM Net Promoter Score: 83**
APPENDIX B

SUPPLEMENTAL ANALYSIS OF ARIZONA HIGHWAYS MAGAZINE SUBSCRIBERS

PRESENTED OCTOBER 16, 2015
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Promoters, Passives, and Detractors</th>
<th>Promoters: 86% (237)</th>
<th>Passives: 13% (35)</th>
<th>Detractors: 1% (3)</th>
<th>Mean rating, “I would recommend AHM to others”: 9.4</th>
<th>Promoters: 89% (104)</th>
<th>Passives: 9% (11)</th>
<th>Detractors: 2% (2)</th>
<th>Mean rating, “I would recommend AHM to others”: 9.5</th>
<th>Mean rating is statistically significant; that is, tested for sample size and determined reliable</th>
<th>Promoters: 85% (429)</th>
<th>Passives: 11% (58)</th>
<th>Detractors: 4% (18)</th>
<th>Subscribers receiving 61+ issues represented 78% of AHM Detractors (or 18 of the 23 Detractors).</th>
<th>Mean rating, “I would recommend AHM to others”: 9.3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Plan to renew subscription (strongly agree, rating 9–10)</td>
<td>90% (195) plan to renew their subscription</td>
<td>92% (108) plan to renew their subscription</td>
<td>92% (465) plan to renew their subscription</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-reported- subscription source Q2</td>
<td>Nearly evenly split between those who purchased issues before subscribing (40%) and those who responded to a subscription offer (38%).</td>
<td>Nearly 40% reported having purchased issues before subscribing and approximately 30% responded to a subscription offer. Fifteen percent had received a gift subscription—highest percentage among respondent groups. Do not recall: 18%</td>
<td>Nearly 40% reported having responded to a subscription offer and approximately 30% purchased issues before subscribing. Ten percent had received a gift subscription. Do not recall: 25%.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial reading habits Q4/Q5</td>
<td>Most (58%) tend to either flip/scan for articles of interest (or read 1-2 articles and then put aside for later reading (44% and 14% respectively). Percent who read in multiple sittings: 36%.</td>
<td>Slightly less than half (48%) tend to flip/scan for articles of interest and then put aside for later reading (35% and 13% respectively). Percent who read in multiple sittings: 41%.</td>
<td>Less than half (43%) tend to flip/scan for articles of interest and then put aside for later reading (33% and 10% respectively). Percent who read in multiple sittings: 40%. Average time spent reading:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interest in AHM Monthly Features</td>
<td>Monthly features with highest interest ratings consistent across all respondent groups: Scenic Drive: 9.5 The Journal: 9.0 Hike of the Month: 8.3 Where Is This: 8.0 Less interest: Editor’s Letter (6.0), Contributors Bios (5.9), Letters to the Editor (6.0)</td>
<td>Monthly features with highest interest ratings consistent across all respondent groups: Scenic Drive: 9.4 The Journal: 9.0 Hike of the Month: 8.0 Where Is This: 8.0 Less interest: Editor’s Letter (6.1), Contributors Bios (6.0), Letters to the Editor (6.4)</td>
<td>Monthly features with highest interest ratings consistent across all respondent groups: Scenic Drive: 9.3 The Journal: 8.8 Hike of the Month: 8.1 Where Is This: 7.8 Less interest: Editor’s Letter (6.5), Contributors Bios (6.1), Letters to the Editor (6.6)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supplemental Analysis by Number of AHM Issues Received</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Received 7-36 issues (N = 275)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Received 37–60 issues (N = 117)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Received 61+ issues (N = 505)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Newbie Subscriber</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transition/Gotcha Subscriber</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Long-term Subscriber</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interest in outdoor activities content</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean rating (10 point scale, 10 is extremely interested). Q7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Top 4 content areas of most interest:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Scenic Drives: 9.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Hiking and Backpacking: 7.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Camping: 6.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Water activities: 5.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Of less interest: horseback riding (4.4), road</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cycling, mountain biking (5.0)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interest in photography subject areas</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean rating (10 point scale, 10 is extremely interested). Q8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Summary of means:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Landscapes: 9.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Wildlife: 9.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Macro: 8.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ People: 7.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interest in travel content</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean rating (10 point scale, 10 is extremely interested). Q9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Summary of means:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Restaurants: 8.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Lodging: 8.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interest in other subject areas</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean rating (10 point scale, 10 is extremely interested). Q10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Top 4 subject areas consistent across respondent groups.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ History: 9.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Nature: 9.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Culture: 8.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Environment: 8.1 (Science: 8.0)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lower interest subject area (rating 7.4) is public issues.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Use of AHM media tools</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean number of days per year (calculation). Q13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Use of all AHM media tools is highest among “newbie” subscribers. Use of AHM Facebook Page is consistent across all respondent groups. Mean number of days per year noted below.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ AHM FB Page: 12.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ AHM Website: 6.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Use of Our Blog is less than one percent across all respondent groups; reported use (0.8%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Use of AHM Facebook Page</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of AHM Facebook Page is consistent across all respondent groups. Mean number of days per year noted below.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ AHM FB Page: 8.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ AHM Website: 3.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Use of Our Blog</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Our Blog is less than one percent across all respondent groups; reported use (0.7%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Our Blog, while quite low is highest among respondents receiving 61+ issues (1%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Agreement: **AHM influence on travel**  
Mean rating (10 point scale, 10 is strongly agree with statement). Q14 | Received 7-36 issues (N = 275) Newbie Subscriber | Received 37-60 issues (N = 117) Transition/Gotcha Subscriber | Received 61+ issues (N = 505) Long-term Subscriber |
| | • **AHM** preferred source for AZ travel information: 7.9  
• Influenced choice of AZ travel destinations: 8.5  
• Motivated day trips: 8.2  
• Motivated multi-day trips/vacation: 8.1  
• **AHM** is my travel guide: 7.4 | • **AHM** preferred source for AZ travel information: 8.1  
• Influenced choice of AZ travel destinations: 8.6  
• Motivated day trips: 8.4  
• Motivated multi-day trips/vacation: 8.1  
• **AHM** is my travel guide: 7.6 | • **AHM** preferred source for AZ travel information: 8.1  
• Influenced choice of AZ travel destinations: 8.6  
• Motivated day trips: 8.0  
• Motivated multi-day trips/vacation: 8.0  
• **AHM** is my travel guide: 7.6 |
| Agreement: **AHM loyalty/affinity**  
Mean rating (10 point scale, 10 is strongly agree with statement). Q15 | • Devoted **AHM** fan: 9.0  
• Must have magazine subscription: 8.7  
• Look forward to receiving monthly issue: 9.2  
• Save/collect issues: 8.1  
• Allows sharing of AZ travel experience: 8.0 | • Devoted **AHM** fan: 9.2  
• Must have magazine subscription: 8.8  
• Look forward to receiving monthly issue: 9.2  
• Save/collect issues: 8.5  
• Allows sharing of AZ travel experience: 8.2 | • Devoted **AHM** fan: 9.2  
• Must have magazine subscription: 9.0  
• Look forward to receiving monthly issue: 9.2  
• Save/collect issues: 7.9  
• Allows sharing of AZ travel experience: 8.0 |
| Agreement: **AHM loyalty/affinity**  
Mean rating (10 point scale, 10 is strongly agree with statement). Q16 | • **AHM** is a family tradition: 5.9  
• Allows sharing/love for Arizona: 7.9  
• Products make great gifts: 7.3  
• Likely purchase gift subscriptions this year: 5.2  
• Likely purchase products this year: 6.6 | • **AHM** is a family tradition: 5.6  
• Allows sharing/love for Arizona: 7.9  
• Products make great gifts: 7.3  
• Likely purchase gift subscriptions this year: 4.5  
• Likely purchase products this year: 6.6 | • **AHM** is a family tradition: 6.3  
• Allows sharing/love for Arizona: 7.7  
• Products make great gifts: 7.1  
• Likely purchase gift subscriptions this year: 5.0  
• Likely purchase products this year: 6.3 |
| Agreement: **AHM experience, value, promoter score**  
Mean rating (10 point scale, 10 is strongly agree with statement). Q17 | • Positive customer experience: 8.6  
• Am getting my money’s worth: 9.2  
• Trust the **AHM** brand-quality publications: 9.1  
• Would recommend **AHM** to others: 9.4  
• Plan to renew **AHM** subscription: 9.5 | • Positive customer experience: 8.9  
• Am getting my money’s worth: 9.2  
• Trust the **AHM** brand-quality publications: 9.2  
• Would recommend **AHM** to others: 9.5  
• Plan to renew **AHM** subscription: 9.6 | • Positive customer experience: 8.7  
• Am getting my money’s worth: 9.2  
• Trust the **AHM** brand-quality publications: 9.1  
• Would recommend **AHM** to others: 9.3  
• Plan to renew **AHM** subscription: 9.6 |
| Reading/technology use  
Percentage reporting use. Q23/Q24 | • Lowest percentage of readers who report subscribing to other print or digital magazines (69%).  
• Top 3 technology devices used:  
  ▪ Desk/lap top: 94%  
  ▪ Smartphone: 73%  
  ▪ Tablet: 52% | • Highest percentage of readers who report subscribing to other print or digital magazines (84%).  
• Top 3 technology devices used:  
  ▪ Desk/lap top: 91%  
  ▪ Smartphone: 71%  
  ▪ Tablet: 61% | • Second highest percentage of readers who subscribe to other print or digital magazines (76%).  
• Top 3 technology devices used:  
  ▪ Desk/lap top: 96%  
  ▪ Smartphone: 56%  
  ▪ Cell phone: 46% |
| Gender | • Male: 53% (145)  
• Female: 47% (130) | • Male: 53% (62)  
• Female: 47% (55) | • Male: 64% (324)  
• Female: 36% (181)  
• Statistically significant higher percentage of male respondents |
| Mean age Q26/Q27 | • Youngest respondent groups  
• Mean age: 61.1 years | • Statistically significant difference in age from “newbie” subscribers  
• Mean age: 64.5 years | • Oldest respondent group  
• Mean age: 68.0 years |
| Arizona residency Q29 | • FT resident: 63%  
• PT: 9%  
• Do not live in AZ: 27% | • FT resident: 50%  
• PT: 18%  
• Do not live in AZ: 32% | • FT resident: 47%  
• PT: 12%  
• Do not live in AZ: 41% |
| Live in AZ FT/PT - length of time Q30 | • Among respondent groups, highest percentage that have lived in Arizona for less than 10 years (45%); with highest percentage living in state 1-4 years (29%)  
• Less than 10 years: 45%  
• 10-14 years: 9%  
• More than 15 years: 46% | • Nearly 60% have lived in state 10 or more years, with one-quarter having lived in the state 10-14 years.  
• Less than 10 years: 40%  
• 10-14 years: 15%  
• More than 15 years: 44% | • Highest percentage live in state 10 years or longer (78%)  
• Less than 10 years: 22%  
• 10-14 years: 23%  
• More than 15 years: 55% |
| Average annual household income Q34 | • Percent reporting $100K consistent across all respondent groups; among subscribers receiving 7-36 issues: 24%  
• Overview:  
  • Less than $50,000: 12%  
  • More than $50,000: 58%  
  • Prefer not to respond: 29% | • Percent reporting $100K consistent across all respondent groups; among subscribers receiving 37-60 issues: 23%  
• Overview:  
  • Less than $50,000: 8%  
  • More than $50,000: 54%  
  • Prefer not to respond: 38% | • Percent reporting $100K consistent across all respondent groups; among subscribers receiving 61+ issues: 25%  
• Overview:  
  • Less than $50,000: 12%  
  • More than $50,000: 54%  
  • Prefer not to respond: 34% |
APPENDIX C

FORMER SUBSCRIBER SURVEY FINDINGS

PRESENTED OCTOBER 16, 2015
Objectives

- Conduct brief survey of AHM former subscribers (average completion time of 5 minutes).
- Obtain information on:
  - Demographics (limited to gender, age, Arizona FT/PT residency)
  - What motivated start of most recent subscription (top 2 reasons)
  - Primary reason for not renewing subscription
  - Overall satisfaction with AHM
  - Use of AHM website, Facebook Page, Blog and purchasing behaviors while a subscriber and after subscription ended
  - Likelihood to recommend AHM (AHM net-promoter score)
  - Benefits that would incentivize or cause individual to seriously reconsider becoming an AHM subscriber
  - Courtesy offer to have AHM contact respondent and preferred means for contact (subscription renewal)
  - Open-ended: What can AHM do to keep valued subscribers like you as customers?
- Provide the AHM team information to supplement or augment understanding of AHM subscriber experience (e.g., dynamics or factors contributing to non-renewal) and incentives or benefits that could potentially incentivize renewal.

AHM Recruitment Lists and Methodology

- Recruitment lists
  - Former subscribers (2 groups, lists received July 1, 2015)
    - Group 1: received 12-24 issues, expired March 2013-March 2015
    - Group 2: received 37+ issues, expired March 2013-March 2015
    - Total e-mail list count: 6,365
  - Criteria used:
    - Expired date range ensures no longer being promoted
    - U.S. only
    - Excludes cancel and complimentary subscriptions
    - Excludes individuals who have specified "no contact from other vendors"
    - AHM lists segmented by number of issues received and coded to reflect list source: 12-24 issues and 37+ issues
- Online survey fielding period
  - Launch: July 15, 2015
  - Survey close date: July 31, 2015
- Incentive to participate
  - Discount code for AHM product purchases through December 31, 2015 (33%)
Analysis of Survey Response

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Former Subscriber Lists</th>
<th>Gross Count e-Mail File Receipt</th>
<th>Completed Surveys</th>
<th>Response Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AZ Former Subscriber (received 12-24 issues)</td>
<td>9,157</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other State Former Subscriber (received 12-24 issues)</td>
<td>1,476</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AZ Former Subscriber (received 37+ issues)</td>
<td>943</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other State Former Subscriber (received 37+ issues)</td>
<td>790</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total list receipt</td>
<td>6,366</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>1.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Does not factor in high number of failed e-mails

- Former subscribers who received 12–24 issues represented 27% of the AHM recruitment list receipt and those who received 37+ issues, 73%.
- Analysis of response by list source reveals that 39% of former subscribers had received 12–24 issues and 61% had received 37+ issues.

Analysis of Survey Response —
Representation/Response by List Source

Survey response: Detail by number of issues received by AZ/out of state mailing address

Summary: Completed Surveys N = 110

- Received 12-24 issues: 39%
- Received 37+ issues: 61%

Survey response: Summarized by number of issues received

Summary: Completed Surveys N = 110

- Received 12-24 issues: 21%
- Received 37+ issues: 40%

Details: Completed Surveys N = 119

- Received 12-24 issues: 18%
- Received 37+ issues: 21%
Demographics

- Gender: 53% were female
- Age — representation by age group:
  - Ages 18-34: 2%
  - Ages 35-44: 7%
  - Ages 45-54: 11%
  - Ages 55-64: 31%
  - Ages 65-74: 30%
  - Ages 75 and older: 10%
  - 80% age 55 and older
  - Average age: 62
- Residency: 73% reported living in Arizona either FT or PT
  - Majority of out-of-state respondents (N = 51), which includes PT Arizona residents (n = 19) and FT out of state residents (n = 32) live in:
    - West (47%)
    - Midwest (23%)
    - Northeast (12%)
    - South (18%)

Primary reasons for subscribing to AHM — interest in Arizona, AHM photography, use of AHM as a travel planning aid or guide

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary reasons for subscribing</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interest in Arizona history, culture, and scenery</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The photography</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel planning aid/guide</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reminded me of my Arizona travel experiences</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desire to live in the Southwest</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good value for the price</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHM’s reputation as a quality magazine</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommended by family or friends</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Received as a gift</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allowed me to connect with family or friends in Arizona</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What motivated you to start your most recent subscription to AHM? (top 2 reasons)

- As selected by 15% of respondents, "Other" factors motivating their decision to subscribe to AHM included:
  - Promotional price offer, discount
  - Interest in learning more about Arizona (move to AZ)
  - Already a long-time subscriber; positive regard for publication
  - Enjoy the content
Approximately half of all former subscribers did not renew due to financial or “other” reasons; 18% reported they had forgotten to renew.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary Reason for not renewing</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Other” reasons</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Had to cut back on expenses</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oops, didn’t mean to let my subscription expire (forgot to renew)</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Didn’t have time to read it</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed address/moved and decided to cancel</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content not interesting or relevant to me</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No longer traveling or planning trip to Arizona</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Person who gave me my AHM subscription didn’t renew it</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- “Other” reasons included:
  - Moved out of Arizona
  - Content is repetitive; not aligned with reader interests
  - Renewed but never received issues
  - Stopped magazine subscriptions
  - Print is too small
- Content not relevant (What type of content would you have appealed to you?)
  - Morefocus on historical, cultural, people features; not interested in articles on food, restaurants, businesses; too many photos, not enough content
- These same reasons were cited by the 10 respondents who rated their satisfaction with AHM as “dissatisfied”

Over half of former subscribers (65%) reported visiting the AHM website while subscribing; slightly more than one-third continued to do so after subscription expired.

![Percentage of Former Subscribers: Ever Used AHM Tools/Purchased Product](image)

- Visited AHM website: 65% while a subscriber, 38% after subscription expired
- Visited AHM FB Page: 15% while a subscriber, 7% after subscription expired
- Visited/joined AHM blog: 15% while a subscriber, 3% after subscription expired
- Signed up AHM online rewards: 8% while a subscriber, 3% after subscription expired
- Purchased AHM store merchandise: 15% while a subscriber, 15% after subscription expired
Vast majority rated satisfaction with AHM as “satisfied to very satisfied” and would likely recommend AHM to others (88% and 84%, respectively).

Net Promoter Score – AHM Promoters, Passives, Detractors

- Net promoter score is used to define the loyalty of an organization’s customers.
- Former subscribers were asked, “Based on your reader experience, how likely are you to recommend AHM to others?“ — 10-point scale, where 10 is “strongly agree.”
- Promoters (rated 9 or 10)
  - Loyal enthusiasts who will keep buying and refer others
  - 64% (76) of the 119 former subscriber survey respondents are AHM promoters
- Passives (rated 7 or 8)
  - Satisfied but unenthusiastic customers who are vulnerable to competitive offerings
  - 20% (24) of former subscribers are AHM passives
- Detractors (rated 6 or less)
  - Unhappy customers who can damage the brand and impede growth through negative word-of-mouth
  - 16% (19) of former subscribers are AHM detractors
- AHM Net Promoter Score 48
"Which of the following benefits, if any, would cause you to seriously reconsider becoming an AHM subscriber?" (Select no more than 2)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefits</th>
<th>N = 119</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Purchase or renew my subscription at a discounted rate</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Purchase a digital subscription to AHM at a discounted rate</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Receive subscriber-only special book offers</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Purchase an AHM gift subscription for someone else at a discounted rate</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Receive subscriber's discount on purchase of AHM products</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Receive subscriber appreciation communications, merchandise coupons, or gifts</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Other (includes: will renew upon move to AZ, when content pertains to my interests; when customer service problem resolved, when price is lowered)</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Earn points or some type of promotional rewards for renewing my subscription or purchasing AHM products</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. None of the above</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A statistically significant greater percentage of respondents residing in Arizona (FT or PT) than those residing out of state reported interest in one or more price-related subscription benefits that collectively included: discounted rate for purchase/renewal of self-subscription, gift subscription, or digital subscription (78% and 58%, respectively).

"What can AHM do to keep valued subscribers like you as customers?"

- Feature more articles on culture and history of Arizona (primarily American Indian, some mention of Hispanic).
- Include more articles pertinent to rural areas, Arizona back country, and hiking.
- Include more photography (e.g., "scenery photos, like the old days").
- Provide additional information about photography (e.g., opportunities for amateur photographers, technical information, photography hints).
- Provide more in-depth content.
  - "Arizona Highways editors can put some thought into written features about Arizona, not just assuming that readers will be satisfied with a few nice snapshots."
  - "Become true journalism, not chamber of commerce promotion."
  - "Deliver interesting, compelling content that stirs my imagination and invites me to explore beyond well-traveled locations out into the unfamiliar."
- Offer less repetitive content.
- Other content-related comments addressed reasons for not renewing subscription (e.g., "magazine is great for what it is, it's just not completely parallel with my interests"; no longer relevant or useful as a travel aid—do not live in or visit Arizona, do not have enough time to read—too many magazine subscriptions).
“What can AHM do to keep valued subscribers like you as customers?”
(cont’d)

- Increase awareness and aggressively market AHM Facebook page.
- Increase awareness of AHM merchandise.
- Lower price, offer discounts and pricing offers, consistency in pricing.
  - “Do not offer a deeply discounted initial subscription price and then upon renewal, gauge a regular subscriber for their renewal price.”
- Offer merchandise discounts (e.g., coupons and special discounts on gifts and books).
- Acknowledge subscribers by offering special registration rates for AHM photography workshops.
- Improve renewal processing (e.g., more reminders, send emails when subscription is due to expire, offer automatic renewal, enable customers to go online to check the status of their subscription).
- Improve order processing and fulfillment and updating of customer records (e.g., renewed but did not receive, already re-subscribed, did renew, receive through Zinio online).
- More outreach to customers (“this survey”).
APPENDIX D

SUBSCRIBER FOCUS GROUP FINDINGS

PRESENTED MAY 27, 2016
Focus Group Objectives

- Conduct two focus groups with AHM subscribers who have received seven to 60 issues and 61 or more issues.
- Solicit customer feedback regarding key points of interest to the AHM editorial and product teams to provide information to supplement or augment their understanding of the AHM subscriber experience.
- Obtain subscriber feedback, opinions, and attitudes regarding:
  - AHM travel content and travel stories
  - Use of online or digital travel magazine subscriptions, e-books, travel-related guidebooks or coffee-table books, and use of the AHM website and other travel websites
  - Plans to renew AHM subscription and purchase AHM gift subscription
  - Suggestions on how AHM can better meet the needs of its readers and promote magazine purchasing and renewal behaviors and the sale of other AHM publications and products, such as guidebooks.

Recruitment Methodology

- Criteria
  - AHM survey respondents who expressed interest in focus group
  - Arizona residents
  - Live in urban area
  - Demographics representative of subscriber base
  - Inclusion of subscribers who initially purchased issues of magazine before deciding to subscribe (newsstand purchasers)
  - Lists segmented by number of issues received (seven to 60 and 61+ issues)
  - Outreach to primary recruitment list and alternates
- Communications
  - E-mail invitation to participate in focus group
  - Multiple follow-up contact attempts (e.g., second attempt, reminder e-mail)
  - Confirmation e-mails
Recruitment Methodology (cont’d)

- Two focus groups, each lasting approximately 1 hour, 45 minutes
  - Monday, February 22, 2016
  - Tuesday, February 23, 2016
- Incentive to participate
  - Participants received a $75 honorarium to thank them for their time
- 13 total attendees
  - 7 for Group 1 (received 1-60 issues)
  - 6 for Group 2 (received 61 or more issues)

Participant Demographics

- Gender
  - 5 males, 8 females
- Age range
  - 45-49: 2
  - 50-54: 2
  - 55-59: 3
  - 60-64: 1
  - 65-69: 2
  - 70-74: 3
- Length of time living in Arizona
  - Less than 4 years: 1
  - 5 to 9 years: 2
  - 10 to 20 years: 5
  - 20 or more years: 5
Participant Demographics (cont’d)

- Place of residence
  - 6 in Phoenix, 2 in Scottsdale, 5 in Mesa

- Subscription catalyst
  - Purchased issues(s) for self before subscribing: 5
  - Responded to subscription offer, purchased for self: 7
  - Received as gift: 1

Materials: Discussion Guide and Aids

- Pre-group exercise
  - Participants asked to spend 15 to 20 minutes exploring AHM website, then complete a questionnaire (e.g., impressions of website, ease of use, search capabilities, likelihood of visiting site more frequently)

- Discussion group materials
  - Sign-in sheet and video/audio release form
  - Handouts: (a) AHM digital publications, (b) AHM Travel & Guide books, (c) FAQs regarding AHM digital magazine subscription, and (d) AHM magazine (public interest story example)
  - Closing exercise: suggestions for AHM team (e.g., improve customer experience, introduce AHM to the next generation of readers, effectively market products)

- Discussion guide topics
  - Travel content: Arizona travel information needs, go-to resources
  - Use and non-use of digital subscriptions, reasons, awareness of AHM online, use of e-books, awareness of AHM e-books, guidebooks
  - AHM website
  - Feature stories (preferences, length of stories, public issue stories)
  - Purchasing behaviors: plans to renew subscription, purchase gift subscription, purchase AHM products
Travel Content

- AHM readers use travel information resources such as magazines, websites, and travel guides or books for different purposes and at different stages during the trip planning process.
- Whereas focus group participants appeared to value resources such as the National Parks Service websites for the finer-grained level of detail and logistical information that is offered, AHM was credited for providing the very impetus to travel, serving as the catalyst and “starting point”.
- AHM’s ability to inspire interest in Arizona tourism and effectively engage with readers to transform interest into the motivation to travel was viewed by participants as the distinguishing value of the magazine.
- Along with the photographic appeal of the magazine, participants applauded the content and the authenticity of the writing as key features that set AHM apart from its competitors and other industry resources.

“Go-To” Resources for Travel Information

- Focus group participants were asked to identify their “go to” resources for Arizona travel information. Participants identified a number of information sources that included magazines, travel guide books, websites, mobile apps, and other sources.
- Magazines and Newspapers:
  - AHM, Phoenix Magazine, Travel, AAA magazine, Backpacker
  - General reference to magazines and books obtained at public libraries
  - Newspaper articles, including dining guides (e.g., Arizona Republic)
  - In general, participants mentioned that they hold onto old issues of magazines and clip and save newspaper articles of interest. When discussing Phoenix Magazine, a few participants referenced the old “kid-friendly” issues. One participant also stated that he had cancelled his subscription to Phoenix Magazine due to a change in editorial direction (“It seemed like it got a lot more hip, a little too cutey”)
- Travel Guides & Books
  - AHM Hiking and Camping Guides, Arizona Chamber of Commerce (AZ Visitors Guide)
  - Arizona state map, ADOT for roads
  - General reference to hiking, backpacking, and camping books and books about Arizona
“Go-To” Travel Information Resources (cont’d)

- Websites
  - AHM, Chamber of Commerce, National & State Park websites (e.g., National Park Service websites), TripAdvisor, Hotels.com, AAA website, oyster.com
  - Use of Google search

- Mobile apps
  - TripAdvisor, various hiking trail apps, mobile apps for hotels and restaurants
  - A few participants stated that their use of mobile apps was to primarily confirm information (“I’ll get information from Arizona Highways or maybe one of the books, or something like that, or TripAdvisor. And then a lot of times, I’ll go to the apps because a lot of people who do a lot of hiking, they will update trails on a regular basis.”)

- Other sources
  - Recommendations from friends and family members

- Use of print and digital formats
  - The vast majority of participants reported use of print magazine and book formats; a few reported use of digital subscriptions to magazines and newspapers

“What suggestions do you have for the AHM team to make AHM the “go-to” resource for information about Arizona travel destinations?”

- Develop an index of Arizona travel destination sites of interest—could be online. Person visiting AHM website could search for a travel site, pull it up and call up the articles in the AHM archive about the travel destination.
- Have better look-up on the website to search for past articles or to find articles on hiking, restaurants, hotels, etc.
- Include more “out of the way” spots to visit.
- Categorize hikes by difficulty level.
- Hard to keep content up-to-date, but important to do.
- Sell AHM as a trusted source for travel information and a quality publication.
- Editor for the Day: short 250-300 word article written by reader as an add-on piece to an exiting story about a travel destination—a reader’s perspective on what we/ AHM do.
- Advertise AHM publications and merchandise; promote AHM tools (e.g., website, monthly newsletter).
- Put AHM books on Amazon.
- Promote AHM magazine and travel guides in newspapers (e.g., Sunday edition of Arizona Republic).
- More TV programs—Arizona Highways Television.
- Think AHM already does an awesome job.
Print Magazine Subscriptions

- Participants expressed a distinct preference for a print over digital format.
- While three participants reported having one or more digital magazine subscriptions:
  - None knew about or had a digital subscription to AhM.
  - One noted that he would prefer the print version (“I’d rather have the magazine in my hand to read it.”). This was also the preference of several other participants who spend a lot of time online and want to have their AhM reading time be time away from work—time away from their computer.
- Sensitivity regarding the “push to digital subscriptions” by magazine and newspaper publishers was acknowledged by participants in both groups.
- For the vast majority, the AhM reader experience is inextricably tied to the tactile experience—savoring the experience of flipping through the magazine, jotting notes in the margin, cutting out articles of interest, creating a personal archive of beloved past issues, taking the magazine along on trips, or passing it along to others for their enjoyment.

Digital Magazine Subscriptions

- The three participants who reported having one or more digital magazine subscriptions were asked to provide feedback regarding the perceived advantages of digital subscriptions:
- Ease of access and use
- Interactive features
- Time-saving features: a) copy and paste; b) e-mail capabilities; c) embedded links that are included in some magazines provide easy access to additional information; and d) “hover over” dictionary features.
- Remaining participants, the vast majority of whom reported non-use of digital magazine subscriptions, were asked to provide feedback regarding their reasons for disinterest in these subscriptions:
- General lack of interest
Digital Magazine Subscriptions (cont’d)

- Limitations of personal technology devices
- Not aligned with readers’ habits
- Use of other tools such as news apps (e.g., NewsHog and AP) which provide information sourced from magazines fulfill the need for digital access to information
- Not yet ready to transition—while a few participants had just recently begun to use e-books or purchased a tablet, they are “not quite there” in moving to a digital subscription or having both print and digital

Use of e-Books

- A total of 8 participants—five in Group 1 and three in Group 2—reported using e-books. Two reported that they solely use e-books, while a few reported that they continue to rely on print books and rarely purchase e-books (e.g., participants typically obtain e-books from libraries such as the Greater Phoenix Digital Library).
- Devices most commonly used for e-books: Kindle, Samsung Tablet, Android Tablet, and iPad
- Usage by group/demographics
  - Most participants in Group 1 (received 7-60 issues, younger demographic) reported that their use or reliance on e-Books has not increased (4 of 5 users): “I adore books. I adore books. I like how they smell. I like how they feel. I actually only use the Kindle to read in the middle of the night when I wake up and can’t fall asleep, but that’s about the only time I actually read e-books.”
  - Most participants in Group 2 (received 60+ issues, older demographic) stated that their use of e-Books has increased primarily due to convenience (e.g., not having to carry around large-sized books, and storage). “I’ve run out of places to put my hard-back books. If I had all of the books that I had in my Kindle, in my house, I’d have to sleep out in the yard.”
Use of e-Books (cont’d)

- Reasons given for continued reliance on print books: a) easier to share, b) option to renew books multiple times from the library; and c) able to mark-up books they plan to keep or are likely to refer back to (e.g., write in the margin, tab pages of interest with sticky notes).
- Total of 5 of the 13 focus group participants reported that they were aware of AHM e-book or digital publications, although no one had purchased any of the products.

Use of Travel Guides

- Participants in both groups reported awareness of AHM Travel Guides, with 11 of 13 participants having purchased one or more travel guides or coffee table books. Purchases included the AHM Hiking Guide, Camping Guide, Photography Guide, and Scenic Drives. One participant also had purchased “All About Saguaros” and “Antelope Wildflowers” (for self and also as a gift) and one had purchased “See and Drive”.
- All participants stated that they were extremely satisfied and happy with their AHM Travel Guide purchase(s).
- Participants first learned about these products as well as other AHM products through the magazine wrapper (tear-off covers) and information contained in AHM magazine articles. One participant also mentioned that he was introduced to the magazine through his purchase of the Photography Guide.
- When asked about their use of travel guides other than AHM publications, most responded that they had purchased and continue to purchase several different guides and often receive “pass along” guides from others.
- Participants could not readily identify all of the travel guide publications they have purchased but were quick to state that they used these guides for different purposes than their AHM guides. The appeal of these other guide books included: a) local resident focused (vs. tourist focused); b) offers site-specific detailed content; and c) supplements the more general information that AHM provides.
"What suggestions do you have for the AHM team to promote purchase of AHM publications and products, such as travel guides?"

- Feature publications and products on social media sites, like Facebook.
- Consider creating some shorter, single focus/topic publications that are not as much of an investment to create (short guides).
- Make improvements to the "Shop" tab/portion of the website—there is a problem in remembering customers (are you an existing customer).
- More advertising of AHM publications and products.
- Advertise in newspapers in sections about travel, road trips, etc.
- And keep doing the specials with shopping because that is great. I mean, promoting the Christmas cards were absolutely beautiful. We ordered Christmas cards from the shop. (Offer more) because you only had two choices in what you could put in there. Like "Merry Christmas" or "Seasons Greetings" and maybe a little bit more to choose from for the pictures. They were beautiful. Everyone we sent them to, loved them.
- And I love that you can order; "To order this photograph," I love that.
- Advertise more in the magazine
- Vary information in the guidebooks to focus on specific regions.
- Advertise (e.g., what is available in the magazine, feature information on website.)
- Feature more than just calendars when advertising products.

Feature and Public Interest Stories

- Vast majority of participants (11 of 13) reported that their interest in reading an AHM story, whether a short or long feature story, was not influenced by the length of the story; rather, it was directly related to their interest in the topic and the extent to which their interest is piqued by the layout and presentation of the story (e.g., photography, title).
- Topics of interest. When asked to comment on specific topics of interest or personal wish list for the types of stories AHM should publish, participants identified human interest stories, stories about Arizona's history, and offering kid-focused materials (e.g., AHM publication, improvements to the AHM website).
- AHM public interest stories
- Participants overwhelmingly stated that it is very important that AHM feature public interest stories.
Feature and Public Interest Stories (cont'd)

- The importance and value of these stories appeared to be rooted in participant beliefs regarding:
  - AHM's obligation to raise awareness of the issues impacting Arizona
  - AHM's role as a credible and trusted source for information—a caring steward
  - AHM's reputation for presenting both sides of an issue in a tasteful yet thought-provoking manner
  - AHM's charge to highlight issues of regional and state importance and to inform and educate (e.g., presenting the views of those directly impacted by the issue at hand, draw attention to funding related issues)
- Participants believe that public interest stories should appear in AHM as issues present themselves and not on some arbitrary forced schedule. Public interest stories should be current, relevant, and highlight issues that warrant the attention of the public.

Arizona Highways: Arizona's Definitive Magazine

Participants expressed their belief that AHM is Arizona's magazine and further, that AHM needs to feature public interest stories on a regular basis.

- "As a newcomer when I first came to Arizona, it was a magazine that told me about Arizona, places to go, things to do. History, and it's just a great book. My grandparents read it and they love it because they've never lived in Arizona. It talks to them things they never knew about Arizona. Educational. It's just a great publication for the state of Arizona."

- "You know, and I was brought up in Kansas, and my aunt and uncle subscribed to the Arizona Highways, and as a child I would go to their home and they'd bound the volumes, and I would spend hours sitting there, just fascinated with what I saw and what I learned to read. I think Arizona Highways, to everybody else, is Arizona, Arizona."

- "If Arizona Highways is going to be the definitive Arizona magazine, then it needs to touch on those things (public interest stories) on a fairly regular basis. Most of us don't think of going to Connecticut, or you know, Alabama, or— you know, Nebraska, as a destination, but people think of Arizona as a destination. People from all over the world come to Arizona, okay? So they're not going to read about these issues in the newspaper. They're not going to subscribe to our local newspaper. But they should know what kinds of issues may impact their visiting, or their desire to come and visit, what changes might be on the horizon or maybe have happened that need to be reversed in some way, if possible. You have to have something that speaks to the rest of the world, for a particular region. If it's not this magazine, then what is it in Arizona?"
Self-Promotion and Advertising Strategies

- Overall, participants believe that AHM needs to more actively promote and raise awareness of the suite of AHM tools, publications, and products that are available to the public. This includes tools such as the AHM website, newsletter sign-up, and social media channels. This also includes AHM digital and print publications and AHM store merchandise products.

- When talking about advertising, participants appeared to draw a distinction between external advertising efforts (e.g., advertising AHM products in publications such as *The Arizona Republic* and on Amazon) and placement of advertising (sponsor ads) in AHM to support the fiscal solvency of the magazine.

- It was, however, made clear that readers have differing views regarding the use of commercial advertising or sponsor ad placements.
  - “I also think the magazine should be bigger. I don’t know if they have some kind of a limit that they have to do to have some kind of a posture situation, but you know another 10 pages wouldn’t hurt anybody. If that was possible, and if five of them were advertising, that wouldn’t kill anybody either.”
  - “One of the things that I like best about the magazine is the lack of advertising, and I would like to see—If they’re going to advertise, then self-advertise things that benefit the magazine as opposed to commercial advertising because that’s one reason why I don’t subscribe to other magazines because it’s hard to find the content in-between the ads.”

Handout: “What suggestions do you have for the AHM team to better meet your needs as a subscriber?”

- Make the website just like the magazine—page for page—so as to have it read like the magazine.
- Include a series of brief stories in each issue; include more “Where Is This?”
- Include more photographs; improve the quality of photographs included in the magazine (not convinced always the best photographs are presented)
- Create links (or provide information) to trails, destinations, or to maps that are on the AHM website.
- Articles on local hikes (e.g., in urban areas—urban hikes in the outlying areas of Phoenix—Tucson—Flagstaff).
- Arizona’s haunted house history (e.g., hotels, old cemetery’s, off the beaten path places like the history of Vultura Mina).
- Improve the search function on the AHM website.
- Expand the number of lodging and dining options presented when featuring a specific travel destination. And don’t change the quality of paper because it asks what makes it. I notice with Phoenix Magazine they went to this other kind of paper on the cover. It’s kind of a— not the gloss. And I don’t like it at all. I like the gloss. That’s what really makes things pop.
- The magazine is very informative and has a wide variety of articles. Enjoy the automatic renewal subscription process.
"What suggestions do you have for the AHM team to introduce AHM to the next generation of potential subscribers?" (cont’d)

- More content, more pages.
- More history of Arizona.
- Include more stories about people in Arizona; a personal interest/human interest story each month.
- Meets my needs.
- Create an AHM magazine for kids—mini-edition; create a smaller student issue (produce at a reduced cost and lower subscription fee).
- Create an interactive digital edition for kids.
- Distribute AHM to schools to promote classroom use.
- Get kids involved in photography, hiking, fun/odd/unique places in the state.
- Use social media—the social media sites that kids use (e.g., Instagram).
- Create interactive apps, a website, Facebook following for kids.
- Feature things for young people to do on AHM website.
- Include more family and kid-friendly content in AHM—articles geared to younger children; feature article on young people in Arizona.

AHM Website: Pre-Group Questionnaire

- The following information provides an overview of focus group participant responses to the pre-group questionnaire regarding the AHM website:
  - Participant ratings of AHM website features and functionality (e.g., organization, visual appeal, search capabilities, overall ease of use, and ability to find information). Finding: participants were overall pleased with the AHM website.
  - Participant comments regarding overall impressions of the website, website changes, and learning regarding information and content included on the website.
  - The extent to which focus group participants agree with statements regarding the influence and impact of the AHM website. Findings: participants overall trust in the credibility of information contained on the website; the website has motivated interest in Arizona travel destinations.
AHM Website: Pre-Group Exercise

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant Feedback</th>
<th>Number of respondents who rated AHM website features and functionality on a 7-point scale where 7 means &quot;excellent&quot; and 1 means &quot;poor&quot; (N=19)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ease of navigating the site</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization of the site</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual appeal of the site</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevance of the content (travel information)</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount of information or content on the site</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ease of search (typed in word or phrase and got relevant results)</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ease of finding information about AHM</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ease of finding information about how to subscribe or renew subscription to AHM</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ease of finding information about the current issue of AHM</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ease of finding information about past AHM Issues</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AHM Website: Pre-Group Exercise (cont’d)

- It is unclear what the site was meant to be, the digital version of the magazine or just highlights.
- White font on white photos – not good. Is there any way to adapt that to color of the underlying content so there is sufficient contrast? That said, fonts are good; nice clean lines, very subtle.
- Lodging needs to be updated regularly; some info is not easy to find due to heading/placement within topic.
- When website first comes up, the header is garbled, but adjusts itself in about 1 second. This might be due to my machine, though.
- Good, modern, easy to use website, I like the scroll downs on the top of the web page

“If you could change one thing about the website, what would it be?”

- It is hard to see all information on mobile device, but OK on computer.
- I would add to the Explore tab Urban Hikes, I’m not sure what Tucson or Flagstaff has to offer for Urban Hikes however the Phoenix area has so many small mountain ranges surrounding the area that a guide to some of the better trails around these areas would be amazing since not everyone has the vehicle or capability of being able to get to the more distant parts of Arizona.
- Make it a digital magazine.
- More relevant answers to search questions
- On the Hikes section, have them separated by ease (i.e., easy, moderate, difficult)
AHM Website: Pre-Group Exercise (cont’d)

"If you could change one thing about the website, what would it be?"
- The renewal function never works for me – I always try combinations of the "two required items", and none of the combos ever seem to work without one of them being my account number. That's not handy if I am at work.
- When on a tabbed page, there is no tab for "Home" – it only took me a try to click on the mag logo, but many people might not know that – especially older readers trying to navigate electronically.
- The scrolling main page top section seems to be the only place to easily find the current issue info, which means it has to scroll around before coming back to that option (?)
- Make the renewal easier
- More things for younger kids...I would like to be able to hook my grandchildren on it...never too young...need different font and appeal to kids as young as 3 years.
- When I went to "Eat and Sleep" it showed the 2014 best restaurants rather than the 2015.
- More about Arizona history and the history of AHM
- The page is almost too cluttered – a lot of information on the bottom of the page. There are too many blogs
- Nothing

AHM Website: Pre-Group Exercise (cont’d)

"What, if anything, did you learn about AHM—that is, information that you were unaware of until visiting the website to complete this exercise?"
- I did not realize that there was a tab for kids or that under the explore tab there was a category for camping which the latter of the two I really like.
- I did not know you have upcoming events on the site.
- Very little
- Didn't know you could specify area of state with hiking, camping info
- To be honest, I wasn't aware of the website. The content of the website is what is in the magazine.
- Did not know there was such extensive restaurant/food and lodging info – very nice to learn! I also was not familiar with the blog info.
- Variety offered
- Link to Fish and Game camps, some history of mag
- That I could order materials from the website: cookbooks, etc.
- Fun kids (grandkids) page.
- Nothing new, fairly familiar with AHM
- Local events are easily accessible.
AHM Website: Pre-Group Exercise (cont’d)

Overall impression of the AHM website

- Easy, friendly, interesting and visually appealing, liked the layout; easy to navigate; well organized; liked clicking on tabs—would help me to find what I would’ve been looking for on a website
- Chaotic
- Like the most about the AHM website
  - "I honestly don’t think I’ve been on the website for over a year. And so when we went on and saw this redesign, I love it, I was blown away. I think it’s absolutely stunning and easy to get around."
  - "There’s more information there than I remembered, especially with the state divided up in the regions—that you could do that and get information about places to go within that region."
- Ability to find information from/about past issues; organization and visual appeal, drop-down menus
- Visual appeal—Fish & Game live cams
- Attractiveness of site with great photos, Photo of the Day, able to go back a long way to see many photos
- What can be improved about the AHM website
  - Good Restaurant search tool on 2014 list
  - When first opened site, garbled header(s); too many blogs
  - Kids area needs work—"I tried to do a search on activities with kids and nothing came up that related to activities with kids that didn’t seem to work really well."
  - Need to feature more history and more about the Native Americans in Arizona
  - More content—pages
  - Include digital subscription in the AHM subscription cost

Participant Feedback | Number of respondents who agreed with each statement, rating their response as “agree to strongly agree” (5–7) using a 5-point scale where 1 means “strongly disagree” and 7 means “strongly agree” (N = 30)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I trust in the overall integrity and credibility of the information and</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>content on the AHM website.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The AHM website inspires people like me to want to get out and visit</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arizona travel destinations.</td>
<td>(9 hitting responses)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The AHM website has influenced or is likely to influence my decision to</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>visit one or more Arizona travel destinations over the course of the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>next 12 months.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The AHM website engages visitors by presenting and encouraging use of</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the AHM blog (Our Blog), monthly newsletter signup features, and social</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>media tools.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The AHM website makes it easy to purchase a subscription to Arizona</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highways magazine.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am likely to increase my visits to the AHM website during the next</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 months.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am likely to recommend the AHM website to family members, friends, or</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>colleagues interested in Arizona travel.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX E. SUPPLEMENTAL ANALYSIS OF AHM PROMOTERS

As noted in this report, the Net Promoter Score (NPS) is a scoring system used to define the loyalty of customers by asking about their likelihood of recommending the company, product, or service to others. The analysis of survey responses revealed that AHM received a superior NPS score of 84 from current subscribers.

The standard NPS rating scale identifies customers as either: Promoters, loyal enthusiasts who will keep buying and refer others; Passives, satisfied but unenthusiastic customers who are vulnerable to competitive offerings; or Detractors, unhappy customers who can damage the brand and impede growth through negative word of mouth. Among the current subscriber survey respondents, Promoters constituted 86 percent. An extensive analysis of demographics and other characteristics of these AHM Promoters was conducted, and the following summary presents the information learned about AHM promoters.

Demographics

- The 770 individuals identified as Promoters represent 86% of the subscriber survey respondents.
- Slightly more than half (56%) are long-term subscribers, having received 61+ issues.
- Nearly sixty percent (58%) are male.
- Their mean age is 65.4.
- Generational analysis/representation:
  - Slightly more than half (55%) are Boomers, with the larger group classified as Older Boomers.
  - Slightly more than one-third (36%) are over age 70, considered members of the Silent Generation.
- Most live in Arizona full-time, with 49% having lived in the state for 15 years or less and 51% for more than 15 years.
  - Mean number of years living in Arizona: 14.6
- The vast majority are married or living with a partner (78%).
- Nearly three-quarters (74%) have a college degree.
- Most are retired and not working (60%); slightly more than one-third (36%) are employed.
Among respondents who opted to provide information regarding their annual household income, a higher percentage of Promoters (13%) than Passives and Detractors reported income of less than $50,000 (8% and 4%, respectively). A significantly lower percentage of Promoters (23%) than Passives (33%) reported income of $100,000 or more; among Detractors, the figure was 39% (low sample size, 9 of 23 Detractors reported income of $100,000+).

Subscriptions to Other Magazines

- Nearly three-quarters of Promoters (74%) subscribe to other print or digital magazines. Among Passives, the figure was 80% and among Detractors, the figure was 70%. There were no statistically significant differences in response between Promoters and Passives.

Use of Technology

- Promoters use technology devices commonly reported by all three groups—desktop or laptop computer, Smartphone, and Tablet.
- Desktop or laptop computer: Promoters (95%); Passives (95%), and Detractors (91%)
- Smartphones: Promoters (64%); Passives (59%), and Detractors (57%)
- Tablet computer: Promoters (48%); Passives (52%), and Detractors (35%)
- No statistically significant differences in response between Promoters and Passives

Use of Social Networking Sites

- A statistically significant greater percentage of Promoters reported use of Facebook than did Passives (56% and 45% respectively). Among Detractors, the figure was 30%.
- A statistically significant greater percentage of Promoters reported use of YouTube than did Passives (33% and 22% respectively). Among Detractors, the figure was 17%.
- Reported use of LinkedIn was somewhat consistent among groups; 23% of Promoters, 20% of Passives, and 17% of Detractors.
- A statistically significant greater percentage of Promoters than Passives reported use of Pinterest (13% and 3% respectively).
- Use of Google Plus+ was as follows: Promoters (10%), Passives (5%), and Detractors (9% or 2 of 23).
**AHM Reading Habits**

*How subscribers first began their subscription to AHM*

- Promoters reported that they began their subscription to *AHM* primarily by responding to a subscription offer (36%) or having purchased one or more issues of *AHM* (newsstand) prior to subscribing (34%).
  - Among Passives, the figures were 36% (responded to subscription offer) and 26% (purchased one or more issues).
  - Among Detractors (N=23), the figures were 52% and 13% respectively.
- While 11% (95) of survey respondents overall reported having initially received an *AHM* gift subscription, Promoters represented 89% (85) of this group followed by Passives (9% or 9) and Detractors (1% or 1).

**Number in household who typically read/look through AHM**

- Approximately 80% of subscribers overall reported that 1-2 others read/look through *AHM*; no statistically significant differences by respondent groups were noted.

**Average time spent reading AHM issue**

- Promoters appear to savor reading *AHM* spending 1 or more hours reading the magazine (collective response: 1 hour, 2 hours, 3 or more hours).
- A statistically significant greater percentage of Promoters than Passives spend one or more hours reading *AHM* (64% and 48% respectively). Among Detractors, the figure was 43% (collective response: 1 hour, 2 hours, 3 or more hours).

**Subscriber Interest in AHM Monthly Features**

Survey respondents were asked to rate their interest in *AHM* Monthly Features using a 10-point scale, where 1 is “not at all interested” and 10 is “extremely interested.” For this particular question, an option was also provided for respondents who felt they were unable to rate their interest level due to lack of familiarity or awareness of a specific feature. Analysis of findings—based on the percentage of subscribers expressing high interest in *AHM* monthly features and the mean rating attributed to each,
reveals that a statistically significant greater percentage of Promoters are “extremely interested” in each of these activities than are Passives (who are interested, but not “extremely interested”).

**AHM monthly features identified as high-interest**

Statistically significant differences between Promoters and Passives: Extremely Interested

- **Scenic Drive**
  - Of the 759 Promoters who answered this question, 89% rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 9.5
  - Of the 102 Passives, 63% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 8.8
  - Of the 22 Detractors, 64% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 8.6

- **The Journal**
  - Of the 763 Promoters who answered this question, 76% rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 9.1.
  - Of the 104 Passives, 37% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 7.8
  - Of the 23 Detractors, 35% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 8.0.

- **Hike of the Month**
  - Of the 758 Promoters who answered this question, 62% rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 8.4.
  - Of the 102 Passives, 37% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 7.3
  - Of the 22 Detractors, 32% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 6.7

- **Where Is This?**
  - Of the 759 Promoters who answered this question, 54% rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 8.1.
  - Of the 103 Passives, 20% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 6.6
  - Of the 23 Detractors, 30% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 6.9
AHM monthly features identified as somewhat less interesting

Statistically significant differences between Promoters and Passives: Extremely Interested

- Editor’s Letter
  - Of the 760 Promoters who answered this question, 27% rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 6.6.
  - Of the 103 Passives, 5% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 4.8
  - Of the 22 Detractors, 4% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 4.1

- Letters to the Editor
  - Of the 765 Promoters who answered this question, 28% rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 6.6.
  - Of the 103 Passives, 4% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 5.2
  - Of the 23 Detractors, 0%. Average rating: 4.7

- Contributors—brief bios
  - Of the 764 Promoters who answered this question, 21% rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 6.3.
  - Of the 103 Passives, 2% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 4.6
  - Of the 22 Detractors, 0% rated their interest 9-10. Average rating: 4.2

Subscriber interest in AHM Outdoor Activities Content

Analysis of findings, based on the percentage of subscribers from each respondent group expressing high interest in AHM outdoor activities and the mean rating attributed to each, reveals that a statistically significant greater percentage of Promoters (N=770) are “extremely interested” in each of these activities than are Passives (N=104) who are interested, but not “extremely interested” in each content area. Detractors (N=23) sample was too small for statistical significance testing.

AHM outdoor activities content identified by respondents overall as high-interest

Statistically significant differences between Promoters and Passives: Extremely Interested

- Scenic Drives
80% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 9.2.

48% of Passives and 57% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10.

Passives average rating: 8.2; Detractors: 8.2

• Hiking and Backpacking

40% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 7.1.

26% of Passives and 26% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10.

Passives average rating: 6.2; Detractors: 5.3

• Camping

27% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 6.0.

11% of Passives and 9% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10.

Passives average rating: 5.1; Detractors: 4.3

AHM outdoor activities content identified by respondents overall as somewhat less interesting

Statistically significant differences between Promoters and Passives: Extremely Interested

• Water Activities

18% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 5.8.

4% of Passives and 0% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10.

Passives average rating: 4.3; Detractors: 3.1

• Road Cycling and Mountain Biking

14% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 4.8.

9% of Passives and 0% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10.

Passives average rating: 3.8; Detractors: 2.4
• Horseback Riding
  o 11% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 4.4.
  o 2% of Passives and 9% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 3.4; Detractors: 3.5

**Subscriber interest in Photography Subject Areas**

Statistically significant differences between Promoters and Passives: Extremely Interested

• Landscapes
  o 92% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 9.6.
  o 69% of Passives and 57% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 8.8; Detractors: 8.7

• Wildlife
  o 84% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 9.3.
  o 51% of Passives and 52% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 8.3; Detractors: 8.5

• Macro
  o 59% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 8.4.
  o 27% of Passives and 26% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 7.1; Detractors: 6.8
• People
  o 56% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 8.3.
  o 19% of Passives and 48% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 6.6; Detractors: 7.5

**Subscriber interest in Travel Content**

Statistically significant differences between Promoters and Passives: Extremely Interested

• Restaurants
  o 68% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 8.8.
  o 40% of Passives and 43% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 7.8; Detractors: 7.3

• Lodging
  o 61% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 8.5.
  o 35% of Passives and 39% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 7.4; Detractors: 7.0

**Subscriber interest in Other Subject Areas**

Statistically significant differences between Promoters and Passives: Extremely Interested

• History
  o 83% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 9.3.
  o 42% of Passives and 52% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 8.0; Detractors: 8.5
• Nature
  o 78% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 9.2.
  o 34% of Passives and 39% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 7.9; Detractors: 8.0

• Culture
  o 68% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 8.8.
  o 28% of Passives and 43% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 7.3; Detractors: 8.0

• Science
  o 54% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 8.3
  o 32% of Passives and 22% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 7.4; Detractors: 7.2

Other subject areas identified by respondents overall as somewhat less interesting

• Public Issues
  o 38% of Promoters rated their interest 9-10 (extremely interested). Promoters average rating: 7.5.
  o 13% of Passives and 30% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 6.3; Detractors: 7.0

Use of AHM Website, Facebook Page, and Blog

• Overall, frequent use of AHM media tools was low: a) 82% of all subscribers reported that they visited or used the AHM website less often than once a month; b) 90% reported that they visited or used the AHM Facebook Page less often than once a month; and c) 96% reported that they visited or used the AHM Blog less often than once a month.
• While no major differences in use were noted, a significantly greater percentage of Promoters (19%) than Passives reported using the AHM website once a month or more (19% and 11%, respectively). Among Detractors, the figure was 9%.

Agreement Statements: Influence of AHM on Travel

Statistically significant differences in response between Promoters and Passives: Strongly Agree

To a far greater extent than Passives or Detractors, Promoters view AHM as having influenced their travel plans and behaviors. When rating their agreement with a series of statements designed to provide insight into the influence of AHM on travel plans and/or decision making, a statistically significant greater percentage of Promoters (N=770) “strongly agreed” than did Passives (N=104). Response data for Detractors (N=23) is also presented.

• AHM is my preferred source for Arizona travel information.
  o 54% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 8.3.
  o 11% of Passives and 13% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 6.5; Detractors: 5.8

• AHM has influenced my choice of travel destinations in Arizona.
  o 67% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 8.8.
  o 26% of Passives and 17% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 7.4; Detractors: 6.6

• AHM has motivated me to take day trips to Arizona travel destinations.
  o 62% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 8.4.
  o 22% of Passives and 9% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  o Passives average rating: 7.0; Detractors: 5.7

• AHM has motivated me to take multi-day trips to Arizona travel destinations or to vacation in Arizona.
  o 60% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 8.3.
- 16% of Passives and 13% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
- Passives average rating: 6.7; Detractors: 6.1

- *AHM* is my Arizona travel guide.
  - 46% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 7.8.
  - 3% of Passives and 18% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 5.7; Detractors: 5.3

**Agreement Statements: AHM Loyalty/Affinity**

Statistically significant differences in response between Promoters and Passives: Strongly Agree

To a far greater extent than Passives or Detractors, Promoters consider themselves to be devoted *AHM* fans, having a high regard for the *AHM* brand and an emotional connection to the magazine (e.g., fond memories and associations). When rating their agreement with a series of statements designed to provide insight into brand loyalty and affinity, a statistically significant greater percentage of Promoters (N=770) “strongly agreed” than did Passives (N=104). Response data for Detractors (N=23) is also presented.

- I am a devoted fan of *Arizona Highways* magazine.
  - 85% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 9.4.
  - 28% of Passives and 22% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 7.7; Detractors: 6.8

- *AHM* is at the top of my list for “must have” magazine subscriptions.
  - 79% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 9.2.
  - 16% of Passives and 13% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 7.0; Detractors: 6.0

- I look forward to receiving my monthly issue of *AHM*.
  - 86% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 9.5.
- 28% of Passives and 26% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
- Passives average rating: 7.8; Detractors: 7.2

- I save and/or collect issues of *AHM*.
  - 67% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree) Promoters average rating: 8.3.
  - 35% of Passives and 22% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 6.6; Detractors: 5.6

- *AHM* allows me to share the Arizona travel experience with others.
  - 62% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). The mean rating for Promoters overall was 8.3.
  - 17% of Passives and 4% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 6.3; Detractors: 4.7

**Agreement Statements: AHM Subscriber Engagement and Purchasing Behaviors**

Statistically significant differences in response between Promoters and Passives: Strongly Agree

To a far greater extent than Passives or Detractors, Promoters are engaged with *AHM*. Areas where agreement with *AHM* value statements is not quite as strong as one might expect include likelihood of purchasing *AHM* products and subscriber plans to purchase one or more *AHM* gift subscriptions during the year. When rating their agreement with a series of statements designed to provide insight into engagement and planned purchases, a statistically significant greater percentage of Promoters (N=770) “strongly agreed” than did Passives (N=104). Response data for Detractors (N=23) is also presented.

- *AHM* is a family tradition shared with children, grandchildren, and/or other family members.
  - 32% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 6.4.
  - 2% of Passives and 4% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 4.2; Detractors: 3.6
• Giving or receiving a subscription to AHM is a great way to share one’s love for Arizona’s iconic beauty, history, and culture.
  - 56% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 8.2.
  - 10% of Passives and 4% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 5.8; Detractors: 4.5

• AHM products make great gifts for family, friends, and colleagues.
  - 40% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 7.5.
  - 7% of Passives and 9% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 5.4; Detractors: 4.1

• I will likely purchase one or more AHM gift subscriptions this year.
  - 24% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 5.2.
  - 7% of Passives and 0% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 3.8; Detractors: 1.8

• I will likely purchase one or more AHM products this year.
  - 36% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 6.7.
  - 9% of Passives and 13% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 5.1; Detractors: 3.7

Agreement Statements: AHM Subscriber Experience, Perceived Value of Subscription, Likelihood to Recommend AHM, Renewal

Statistically significant differences in response between Promoters and Passives: Strongly Agree

To a far greater extent than Passives or Detractors, Promoters are passionate about AHM, have a high level of trust in the brand, and believe that subscribing to AHM is money well spent. When rating their agreement with a series of statements about their AHM customer experience and their likelihood to
recommend AHM to others, a statistically significant greater percentage of Promoters (N=770) “strongly agreed” than did Passives (N=104). Response data for Detractors (N=23) is also presented.

- I have had a positive customer experience when purchasing or renewing my subscription to AHM.
  - 78% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 9.0.
  - 6% of Passives and 22% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 6.8; Detractors: 5.9

- I feel as though I am getting my money’s worth by subscribing to AHM.
  - 90% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 9.5.
  - 12% of Passives and 22% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 7.5; Detractors: 6.0

- The AHM brand is a brand that I trust, whether subscribing to the magazine or purchasing an AHM Guidebook, I know that I can count on the AHM name for a quality publication.
  - 89% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree) Promoters average rating: 9.5.
  - 4% of Passives and 18% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
  - Passives average rating: 7.3; Detractors: 5.9

- I would recommend AHM to others.

This question was used to identify Promoters, Passives, and Detractors and to support analysis by respondent groups.

  - Promoters—defined as respondents who “strongly agree” (rating of 9-10)—numbered 770 and represented 86% of respondents. Mean rating: 9.7.
  - Passives—defined as respondents “Agree” (rating of 7-8)—numbered 104 and represented 11% of respondents. Mean rating: 7.7
  - Detractors—defined as respondents who are either neutral or disagree (rating of 1-6)—numbered 23 and represented 2% of respondents. Mean rating: 4.7.
I plan to renew my subscription to AHM.

- 98% of Promoters rated their agreement 9-10 (strongly agree). Promoters average rating: 9.8.
- 57% of Passives and 43% of Detractors rated their interest 9-10
- Passives average rating: 8.5; Detractors: 7.3

Focus Group Participation

Survey respondents were asked, “Would you be interested in participating in an upcoming in-person group discussion about Arizona Highways magazine? The discussion will be conducted in August and will give participants the opportunity to provide additional feedback and suggestions regarding their AHM reader experience. If you qualify and participate, you will receive a $75 honorarium (check) as a thank-you. Would you like to receive information about participating in this discussion group?”

- 27% (206) of Promoters expressed interest
- 10% (10) of Passives expressed interest
- 13% (3) of Detractors expressed interest